

March 8, 2019

To: UCSF School of Nursing (SON) Faculty and Leadership

From: Nursing Faculty Council (NFC)

Developed by: Nursing Faculty Council workgroup on inclusive learning environment (Abbey Alkon, Kim Dau, Kristen Harknett, Soo-Jeong Lee, Michele Pelter)
Judy Martin-Holland, Associate Dean for Diversity, Inclusion, and Community Outreach
Student representatives from SON Anti-Oppression Work Group and members of Associated Students of the School of Nursing (ASSN), herein referred to as 'the students'

Re: UCSF SON students report experiences of oppression (i.e., exclusion, stigmatization and microaggression) in the classroom, clinical setting, and curriculum.

Purpose of this memo: Describe the student-identified issues and propose recommendations to NFC and SON administration.

Statement of Issues: At the UCSF SON, we are committed to upholding a culture of embracing diversity, equity, inclusion and respect, and creating learning environments that reflect these values. Research and clinical practice often delineates findings and recommendations across social identities, such as race and gender. Although the measurement of racialized or gendered outcomes can be valuable in understanding inequities, it is important to deconstruct the linkage of social identity to research outcomes and clinical management recommendations; applying population epidemiologic data to individual cases requires appropriate contextualization to avoid stereotyping and harmful consequences.

SON students report experiences of oppression individually and as a community both in the classroom and in clinical rotations. The environment experienced by our students is in conflict with our SON's mission and values as the School has focused on promoting diversity, inclusivity and equity. It is important to evaluate whether what we teach and how we teach our students is inclusive and respond when it is not. It is our community's responsibility to steward the academic success and social/emotional well-being of our students, transform health care practices, and graduate diverse nurses, practitioners, health policy & public health specialists, nurse scientists, and future faculty.

Role of NFC: The UC principles of faculty governance provides faculty the oversight of all academic curriculum. The NFC is the SON leadership council at UCSF with oversight responsibilities over the SON curriculum. Following concerns raised by the students about diversity and inclusion within the SON curriculum, the NFC reached out to the students to learn more about their concerns and experiences. NFC convened a workgroup in June 2018 and worked with the student representatives and Judy Martin-Holland, with the goal of presenting a summary of findings to the NFC along with recommendations aimed at addressing identified issues. These findings and recommendations are now being shared with all SON faculty.

UCSF SON Learning Environment: All members of the UCSF SON academic community should teach, conduct research, and provide clinical care in an equitable, inclusive and respectful environment. We recognize that some identities are privileged by society over others. The UCSF SON is committed to creating learning environments that embrace our values of equity, inclusion, and respect and foster psychological safety for all students, especially those that have been marginalized by society. Eliminating bias and discrimination from the health care system requires elimination of bias and discrimination in nursing education. As a higher learning institution, it is our community's responsibility to:

1. Challenge each other to see our "cultural blind spots"
2. Engage in lifelong learning
3. Demonstrate awareness and address issues of inclusivity and equity when they arise in the classroom
4. Maintain openness to feedback
5. Practice cultural humility through compassionate self-reflection
6. Steward the academic success and social/emotional well-being of our students

Student Anti-Oppression Action Group. In 2017, a group of students formed the "Anti-Oppression Work Group" to identify and discuss their lived experiences of oppression in the SON learning environment. Students report experiencing:

- Racism
- Xenophobia (lack of inclusion of: Migrants, Immigrants, Refugees, and Language Diversity)
- Sexism
- Heterosexism (lack of inclusion of: Queer/Gay/Bisexual/Lesbian/Non-traditional families)
- Transphobia (lack of Gender Inclusivity)
- Ableism (lack of inclusion of: Persons with Disabilities, Mental Health, Neurodiversity, & Care of People with Chronic Conditions)
- Lack of Body-Positive Inclusivity
- Class Oppression
- Religious-Based Oppression

Issues and Recommendations: The NFC Workgroup discussed the current student concerns regarding course content and curricula. This is a list of the identified issues, followed by several strategies to address each issue. This work coincides well with the SON Strategic Plan's Diversity Imperative. We recognize that multiple stakeholders are responsible for enacting these recommendations. In order to encourage the SON community's participation and engagement, we recommend the formation of a Task Force under the Associate Dean for Diversity, Inclusion, and Community Outreach to comprehensively address the identified issues. The Task Force should have participants from all entities responsible for the recommended follow-up.

Items related to curriculum and requiring NFC follow-up:

1. *Dissonance between stated UCSF SON mission/values and student experiences:*

- a. Develop guidelines for inclusive learning environment that lives in the Faculty and Student handbooks. (*actively underway*)
 - i. Guideline should include a clear statement from the SON about a shared understanding about race, racism, health disparities and inequities.
 - ii. Guideline should include definitions, curriculum guidelines and resources for faculty and tools to help students think critically and contribute to advancing the knowledge base.
 - iii. Guideline should be co-developed by students and faculty.
 - iv. Introduce guideline in new faculty orientation and student orientation.
 - v. Establish a policy requiring that faculty review the guidelines when preparing or developing learning content and teaching materials and provide the guidelines to guest speakers for their review and class preparation
 - b. Create shared student and faculty space to build awareness of guideline, as well as build trust and relationship;
2. *Lack of specific and structured data collection and reporting on inclusivity of learning environment in course and program evaluations with defined metrics to measure growth and improvement:*
- a. Review and revise the course (including clinical) and program evaluations to measure students' perception on inclusivity of learning environment.
 - b. Define metrics for benchmarking.
 - c. Establish an ongoing review system with each SON Program Council to identify needs for changes in the curriculum and support the changes in coordination with the SON Educational Policy Council, Associate Dean for Academic Programs, and Associate Dean for Diversity, Inclusion, and Community Outreach;
 - d. The Associate Dean for Academic Programs and Associate Dean for Diversity, Inclusion, and Community Outreach will review a summary of the evaluations annually with NFC and plan intervention (e.g., trainings) as needed.
 - e. Use equity pedagogy as the guide for the curriculum review and development (see definition below, etc.).

Items requiring follow-up from School of Nursing administrators

- 3. *Need for guidance for faculty, guest lecturers and preceptors related to teaching and course preparation to promote inclusive learning environment and avoid oppressive language or content.*
 - a. Develop proactive and ongoing faculty training plans and timeline to address and support faculty needs to build and teach in an inclusive learning environment, including knowledge of structural oppression and promotion of self-reflection;
 - i. Ongoing online, in-person, off-site, and other trainings should be available to all SON faculty;
 - ii. Trainings and topics should cover a relevant spectrum of the faculty's discipline and context – research, lecture, seminar, clinical supervision;

- iii. Make consultation and training from experts in the fields of diversity, race, justice, inclusion, and communication available for faculty;
 - iv. Assure that all faculty-of-records are trained in HEALS;
 - b. Provide administrative support to provide resources for ongoing training, tracking, and consultation.
 - i. Provide resources (personnel, financial, release time) for faculty to attend regular trainings and/or educational workshops.
 - ii. Support trainers to offer the HEALS training in-person and as a hybrid option, if possible;
 - iii. Continue to support the SON Office of Diversity and Inclusion with ample resources to address the present and future faculty needs.
- 4. *Need for a clear chain of accountability, spanning all the environments where the SON students learn in and from SON faculty and administration, guest lecturers and preceptors not employed by UCSF:*
 - a. SON administration, in collaboration with NFC and Education Policy Council, should develop a policy to define “inclusive learning environments” and outline faculty role and responsibility in regard to maintaining inclusive learning environments and curriculum;
 - b. The policy should be included as part of the “guideline” referenced in recommendation 1(a).
 - c. Track faculty training to ensure every faculty-of-record has the skills to deal with microaggressions and other classroom issues using HEALS;
- 5. *Need for a clear and formal process for students to raise or report concerns; this process should include a mechanism for follow-up with the reporting student, if desired and appropriate. Student follow-up should take into consideration of the student’s social and emotional well-being:*
 - a. SON administration should provide mechanisms and procedures for students to report experiences of oppression of individuals and/or communities in UCSF learning environments. It should also define reasonable expectations for student follow-up after reporting an incident. The policy must interface with the [Office for the Prevention of Harassment and Discrimination](#) (OPHD) reporting requirements;
 - b. A facilitated conflict transformation process when indicated.
 - c. Offer UCSF resources for mental health wellness services for SON students when student experiences harm and mental distress;
 - d. Engage UCSF campus resources to support these recommendations.
- 6. *SON commitment to the campus diversity initiatives and PRIDE (see references):*
 - a. Recommend that SON reinforce school connection to Office of Diversity Outreach (ODO) and Multi-Cultural Resource Center (MRC);
 - b. Provide a catalogue of SON resources for faculty, staff, and students on diversity, race, inclusion trainings and support.

- c. Continue to advance hiring and retention of more faculty of color, including tenure track, clinical faculty, clinical instructors and preceptors.

Reference:

Equity Pedagogy is defined as “teaching strategies and classroom environments that help students from diverse racial, ethnic, and cultural groups attain the knowledge, skills, and attitudes needed to function effectively within, and create and perpetuate, a just, humane, and democratic society.” (Banks, *Theory into Practice*) In other words, Equity Pedagogy intends to challenge fundamental societal structures of inequity by equipping students with basic skills which will help them be facilitators for social change. In response to ongoing student and faculty concerns about how implicit biases and assumptions are shaping our learning environments, the SON can learn about equity pedagogy and use it to guide our teaching mission.

[Banks, James A. "Multicultural Education: Goals and Dimensions." Center for Multicultural Education. University of Washington College of Education, 2011. Web. 05 Nov. 2012. <http://education.washington.edu/cme/view.htm>.](http://education.washington.edu/cme/view.htm)

SON Mission Statement: To educate diverse health leaders, conduct research, advance nursing and inter-professional practice, and provide public service with a focus on promoting health quality and equity.

UCSF PRIDE values:

P - Professionalism: To be competent, accountable, reliable and responsible, interacting positively and collaboratively with all colleagues, students, patients, visitors and business partners.

R - Respect: To treat all others as you wish to be treated, being courteous, kind and acting with utmost consideration for others.

I - Integrity: To be honest, trustworthy and ethical, always doing the right thing, without compromising the truth, and being fair and sincere.

D - Diversity: To appreciate and celebrate differences in others, creating an environment of equity and inclusion with opportunities for everyone to reach their potential.

E - Excellence: To be dedicated, motivated, innovative and confident, giving your best everyday, encouraging and supporting others to excel in everything they do.