

## Proposal Revisions for Appendix IV of the UCSF Bylaws

Edited on May 14, 2016 and again on July 1, 2016

**Comment on July 1, 2016:** In this version, the edits that were tracked in the May 14, 2016 version and subsequently reviewed by Rules and Jurisdiction (R&J) Committee have all been “accepted.” You can view those tracked changes in the copy of the “R&J Agenda, June 7, 2016.pdf” document. Below, all tracked changes and comments are new and made in response to the following R&J Committee comments that were communicated to the SOM by Mr. Artemio Cardenas:

*Proposed new text for: Appendix IV (p. 4), number two, “Membership & Voting Privileges,” B., is still difficult to parse. R&J recommends replacing the semicolons with commas in this clause. In addition, R&J suggests that ‘Director’ be added for each position in the latter half of this section.*

### Proposed new text for: Appendix IV Bylaws, Regulations, and Procedures of the School of Medicine Bylaws of the Faculty of the School of Medicine (University of California, San Francisco)

#### Section II Committees

##### 2. Standing Committees

###### A. Committee on Curriculum and Educational Policy

###### 1. Functions

- a. The committee shall provide oversight for the continuum of medical education at the UCSF school of medicine. This includes direct oversight and accountability for undergraduate medical education. Graduate medical education (GME) and continuing medical education (CME) shall participate in the CCEP as described below and report to CCEP for informational purposes.
- b. The committee shall establish educational policy, plan future directions for educational programs and environments, evaluate educational programs, and promote educational innovations and scholarship.
- c. The chair of the committee shall work closely with the Vice Dean for Education to direct the continuum of medical education.

###### 2. Membership and Voting Privileges

a. Members will be appointed by the Vice Dean for Education and confirmed by the School of Medicine Council of the Faculty.

b. Members will include

i. ~~Eight~~ at large faculty members who will be chosen to provide, so far as possible, liaison with the basic science departments, the clinical departments, and the affiliated teachings hospitals. [Am. 9/91].

ii. ~~Two~~ student representatives from the MD curriculum.

iii. ~~Two~~ graduate medical education trainees.

c. The following shall serve as voting *ex officio* members:

i. Vice Dean for Education.

ii. Associate Dean for Assessment and Professional Standards, Associate Dean for Curriculum, Associate Dean for Students, Associate Dean for Admissions, Associate Dean for CME and GME, ~~and Associate Dean for Medical Education.~~

iii. ~~Director of the Medical Student Training Program (MSTP),~~ Director of the Program in Medical Education – Urban Underserved (PRIME-US), ~~Director of the~~ UCSF/UC Berkeley Joint Medical Program (JMP), ~~and Director of the~~ Academy of Medical Education (AME).

d. The following will be permanent guests:

i. Dean of the School of Medicine.

**Comment [SM1]:** This section has been edited to provide clarity.

**Deleted: ;**

**Deleted: ; and t**

**Deleted: ;**

**Deleted: ;**

- ii. GME Director of Curricular Affairs, and GME Director of Resident and Fellow Affairs
    - iii. Chairs of the UME curriculum subcommittees
  - e. CCEP members eligible for the position of Chair of CCEP include any non-Dean's staff members of CCEP who have completed one term on CCEP. The Chair will be appointed by the Vice Dean for Education and confirmed by the Council of the Faculty. The Chair will serve two years as Chair and one year as immediate past chair.
- 3. Terms
  - a. At large (non ex officio) faculty members shall be appointed for a term of three years, renewable once and staggered such that no more than half of the at large members rotate off at once. Members may be removed if they have repeated absences from meetings or fail to carry out appointed responsibilities.
  - b. Student and Resident members shall be appointed for a two-year, non-renewable term.
- 4. Reporting Relationship
  - a. The CCEP reports jointly to the Vice Dean of Education for the School of Medicine for strategic visioning and to the Council of the Faculty for curricular oversight and educational policy changes.
  - b. The CCEP Chair is an ex-officio member of the Council of the Faculty and is expected to attend all meetings of the Council of the Faculty.
- B. Committee on Admissions
  - 1. Functions
    - a. The Committee on Admissions shall review and evaluate all applicants to the School of Medicine Undergraduate Medical Education program, leading to the degree of Doctor of Medicine (MD).
    - b. The Committee on Admissions is responsible for and has the sole authority to evaluate candidates and select matriculants to the School of Medicine.
  - 2. Membership
    - a. The Associate Dean for Admissions will appoint and the School of Medicine Council of Faculty will confirm members to the School of Medicine Committee on Admissions.
    - b. Membership will include faculty and students who represent the diversity of UCSF School of Medicine. Faculty members will predominate in a ratio of at least 2:1.
    - c. The Associate Dean for Students will serve as a non-voting ex officio member of the committee.
    - d. A subset of the Committee on Admissions will serve as the Executive Committee on Admissions. The Executive Committee on Admissions may include students, with faculty members predominating in a ratio of at least 2:1.
  - 3. Procedures
    - a. The Associate Dean for Admissions will serve as the Chair of the Committee on Admissions and Chair of the Executive Committee on Admissions and will orient the members of the committees.
    - b. The Associate Dean for Admissions is responsible for establishing operational policies that ensure that the admissions process and the Committee on Admissions conducts its work in a manner consistent with California law, with UC and UCSF policy, and in accordance with requirements from relevant external accreditation and regulatory bodies.
    - c. The final decision for admission will be made through a vote of the Executive Committee on Admissions. Each member has one vote.
- C. Committee on Academic Progress for the School of Medicine Undergraduate Medical Education Programs

Deleted ;

1. Functions
    - a. The Committee on Academic Progress is charged with assessment of the performance of all students at the completion of any phase of the curriculum and no less frequently than annually.
    - b. For each student, the Committee on Academic Progress will make one of the following recommendations to the Dean or Designee.
      - i. Promotion to the next phase of the curriculum.
      - ii. Promotion to the next phase of the curriculum with conditions (such as remediation), with or without a probationary status (see Section VII D, below, of these bylaws).
      - iii. Graduation from the School of Medicine.
      - iv. Formal repetition of one or more parts of the curriculum on a probationary status.
      - v. Referral to the Committee on Academic Standards.
  2. Membership
    - a. The Committee on Academic Progress is comprised of all School of Medicine Coursework Directors.
    - b. The Committee on Academic Progress will be chaired by the Associate Dean for Competency Assessment and Professional Standards. In the event that the Associate Dean for Competency Assessment and Professional Standards is absent, a designated associate dean may stand in.
  3. Process
    - a. The Committee on Academic Progress will use consent agendas to advance, promote, or graduate students who meet all criteria for academic promotion without conditions (such as remediation), or graduation. Students not meeting criteria for promotion without conditions or graduation will be reviewed by the committee.
    - b. Deliberation on the decision to refer a student to the Committee on Academic Standards requires a quorum of 51% of Coursework Directors in the relevant phase of the curriculum for a student under consideration.
      - i. Decisions will be made by a simple majority vote of the quorum.
- D. Committee on Academic Standards
1. Functions
    - a. The Committee on Academic Standards is the School of Medicine committee charged with the in-depth review of the performance of a student who meets one or more of the following criteria:
      - i. The student does not meet standards for promotion to the next phase of the curriculum.
      - ii. The student meets the criteria for dismissal or disqualification.
      - iii. The student has or is alleged to have violated University policies or campus standards of conduct, as described in the University of California 100.00 Policy on Student Conduct and Discipline.
    - b. A student may be referred to the Committee on Academic Standards by the Committee on Academic Progress.
    - c. In exigent circumstances, a School of Medicine associate dean with designated authority for student assessment or curricular oversight may refer a student directly to the Committee on Academic Standards.

2. Membership
  - a. There will be seven at-large faculty members on the Committee for Academic Standards.
    - i. Members will be appointed by the Vice Dean for Education and confirmed by the School of Medicine Council of Faculty.
    - ii. Members will serve an eight-year term contingent on satisfactory annual performance as judged by the Committee Chair.
  - b. A Committee Chair will be appointed by the Vice Dean for Education and confirmed by a vote of the Academic Standards Committee. The Chair will serve in the role for a term of three years, renewable once.
  - c. The Associate Dean for Competency Assessment and Professional Standards will serve as a non-voting member.
    - i. It is the responsibility of the Associate Dean for Competency Assessment and Professional Standards to orient the Committee members to their roles and responsibilities.
    - ii. The Associate Dean for Competency Assessment and Professional Standards will prepare materials for the committee and communicate the logistics of the committee process to the student.
    - iii. In the event that the Associate Dean for Competency Assessment and Professional Standards is unavailable, the Associate Dean for Curriculum may assume this role.
  - d. The Associate Dean for Students will attend all deliberations of the Committee on Academic Standards as a permanent guest.
3. Process
  - a. The process of the Committee on Academic Standards is described in the UCSF Academic Senate Bylaws Appendix VII: 4.0 Step 2: In-Depth Review and Dismissal Action.
4. Appeal
  - a. A student for whom the Committee on Academic Standards has recommended dismissal is entitled to appeal the decision in accordance with the UCSF Academic Senate Bylaws Appendix VII: 5.0 Appeal.

**Proposed new text for: Appendix IV: Regulations, of the Faculty of the School of Medicine, UCSF (University of California, San Francisco)**

**I. DEFINITIONS**

- A. Coursework: Course, clerkship or any unit of educational experience that leads to the awarding of a grade and/or credit. Coursework also encompasses educational experiences while on Programmatic Leave of Absence (VIII. A.1.a.i)
- B. Curriculum Phase: A distinct set of related coursework that is followed by a major transition to a new set of coursework or to graduation.
- C. Designated associate dean(s): One or more associate deans in medical student education who have been designated by the Vice Dean for Education as having authority to issue, oversee, and adjudicate issues of grades, credit, and remediation.
- D. Physicianship Evaluation Form: A performance evaluation documenting student behavior that does not sufficiently demonstrate the professional and personal attributes of professionalism inherent in being a physician.

**II. ADMISSIONS**

- A. Graduate Professional: Curriculum leading to the degree of Doctor of Medicine
  - 1. Admission to Regular Status: To be admitted to the School of Medicine, an applicant must:
    - a. Meet School of Medicine admission requirements and the requirements of any unique program to which the candidate is applying.
    - b. Meet the Technical Standards of the School of Medicine, with or without institutionally approved accommodations.
    - c. Be evaluated and recommended for acceptance in accordance with the policies and procedures of the Committee on Admissions.
  - 2. Admission to Advanced Standing
    - a. The School of Medicine does not admit students to advanced standing.
- B. Postgraduate Professional (Graduate Medical Education, GME)
  - 1. To be admitted to a GME education program, an applicant must be evaluated and recommended for acceptance by the appropriate GME review committee.

**III. REGISTRATION**

- A. Students must register and meet the requirements for registration as defined in the Academic Senate Regulations 540-546.
- B. Students who fail to register may be subject to discontinuation. (see Section VIII.B.2).

**IV. DEGREE AND CERTIFICATE REQUIREMENTS**

- A. Degree of Doctor of Medicine
  - 1. Students will be awarded the degree of Doctor of Medicine when they have satisfactorily completed all required coursework and have been judged by the Committee on Academic Progress to have met or exceeded all graduation requirements.
  - 2. Students must be registered in the quarter in which they graduate. (AM 4/90)
  - 3. The Vice Dean for Education in the School of Medicine has the authority to review and approve requests for posthumous awarding of the degree of Doctor of Medicine.
- B. Certificate of Completion of Postgraduate Medical Study
  - 1. A candidate who has satisfactorily fulfilled the requirements of a UCSF graduate medical education program that is recognized by the Office of Graduate Medical Education is eligible for a certificate of completion of postgraduate medical study.
  - 2. The Chair or designee of the appropriate Department will recommend eligible candidates for a certificate of completion, based on documentation that the candidate has satisfactorily met the program requirements.
  - 3. The certificate will be affixed by a seal and signed by the Dean of the School of Medicine or designee.

**V. CLASSIFICATION OF COURSES**

- A. Graduate Professional: Courses designed primarily for graduate professional students are identified by the numbers 100-199 in accordance with School of Medicine convention.
- B. Graduate Academic: Courses designed primarily for graduate academic students are identified by numbers 200-299 in accordance with Graduate Division convention.
- C. Post Graduate Professional: Courses designed primarily for postgraduate medical study are identified by numbers 400-499.

**VI. GRADES AND CREDITS FOR CANDIDATES FOR THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF MEDICINE**

- A. The Associate Dean for Curriculum will establish which coursework may be taken for credit towards completion of the degree and what amount of credit will be granted for satisfactory completion of each element of coursework, in alignment with the University of California Regulations of the Academic Senate SR 760.
  - 1. Directors of approved coursework will establish and publish the criteria for grades and will assign a grade for each student at the conclusion of the educational experience.
  - 2. The Office of the Registrar will maintain a record of each student's course completion, grade, and credit.
- B. The work of all professional students who are candidates for the MD degree shall be reported using the grades and descriptors defined in the Regulations of the San Francisco Division: SFR 785.
- C. Physicianship Evaluation Forms
  - 1. Coursework Directors may issue a Physicianship Evaluation Form for a student who fails to meet the professionalism standards of the coursework.
  - 2. Designated associate dean(s) may issue a Physicianship Evaluation Form for a student who exhibits unprofessional behavior outside of regular coursework, including while on a programmatic leave of absence from UCSF.
- D. Repetition of Course or Curriculum
  - 1. A designated associate dean may allow or require a student to repeat coursework, a term or a year if a student is eligible to continue in the curriculum.

## VII. SCHOOL OF MEDICINE STUDENT PROGRESS REQUIREMENTS

- A. Time to Graduation
  - 1. The School of Medicine will publish its requirements for the maximum time to graduation, which may be amended periodically.
  - 2. A student whose pace of progress in the MD curriculum precludes the completion of all required coursework for the degree of Doctor of Medicine within the maximum time to graduation designated by UCSF School of Medicine policy is subject to dismissal from medical school.
- B. Technical Standards
  - 1. The School of Medicine will publish its Technical Standards, which will be revised when indicated and may be amended from time to time.
  - 2. Medical students must meet Technical Standards at all times with or without institutionally approved accommodations.
  - 3. Matriculants to the School of Medicine will be required to affirm their ability to meet the Technical Standards.
  - 4. A student seeking accommodations for protected disabilities must register with the responsible UCSF Office to seek institutionally approved accommodations.
  - 5. Accommodations for protected disabilities must be sought in advance of the educational activities for which the accommodations are relevant.
  - 6. Failure to seek or to use institutionally approved accommodations will not be accepted as sufficient grounds to circumvent adverse action.
  - 7. A student who is unable to meet Technical Standards may be subject to adverse actions, including dismissal, disqualification or discontinuance from medical school.
- C. Student Conduct During Performance Assessments
  - 1. Faculty or designees who are responsible for student performance assessment must inform the student prior to the assessment what materials are necessary, what may be in the

student's possession or vicinity during the assessment, and what student conduct is required while undergoing the assessment.

2. Access to all other materials or information that may act as an unauthorized aid during the assessment is expressly prohibited.
  3. Violation of this rule or other substantive evidence of academic misconduct related to performance assessment shall subject the student to academic disqualification, in accordance with the University of California 100.00 Policy on Student Conduct and Discipline.
- D. Student Academic Standing
1. There are three categories of student academic standing:
    - a. Good Academic Standing
      - i. A student is considered to be in good academic standing if eligible to return to or continue in the curriculum.
    - b. Good Academic Standing on Academic Probation
      - i. A student whose performance is described in one of the following ways is on Academic Probation:
        - a) A student has earned E or F grade(s) in coursework totaling six or more credit units in any quarter.
        - b) A student has earned E or F grade(s) in coursework totaling 10 or more credit units in 3 consecutive quarters.
        - c) A student has received Physicianship Evaluation Forms in excess of the number allowed by UCSF School of Medicine Policy.
      - ii. Students on Academic Probation are eligible to continue in the curriculum and are considered to be in good academic standing.
      - iii. The status of Academic Probation will remain in effect until removed by definitive action of the Committee on Academic Progress, under the following circumstances:
        - a) A student on academic probation resulting from E or F grades who successfully repeats all educational experiences in which a grade of E or F was received and who then earns P or H grades in all coursework in a subsequent quarter of school.
        - b) A student on academic probation resulting from excessive Physicianship Evaluation Forms who completes a subsequent three quarters of enrollment without additional Physicianship Evaluation Forms.
    - c. Not in Good Academic Standing, Eligible for Dismissal
      - i. Under the following circumstances, a student on Academic Probation is eligible for dismissal:
        - a) A student on academic probation for coursework grades receives an E or F grade.
        - b) A student on academic probation for excessive Physicianship Evaluation Forms receives an additional physicianship evaluation form.
      - ii. A student previously on academic probation for excessive Physicianship Evaluation Forms is eligible for dismissal if the student receives a subsequent Physicianship Evaluation Form.
      - iii. A student who is eligible for dismissal is not in good academic standing and is precluded from participating in direct patient care activities and in extramural electives.

#### VIII. TEMPORARY OR PERMANENT SEPARATION OF STUDENTS FROM THE SCHOOL OF MEDICINE

- A. Temporary Separation of Students from the School of Medicine: Leaves of Absence
  - 1. Voluntary Leaves of Absence: a temporary separation of a student from the School of Medicine, with the expectation that the student will return to the School of Medicine within an assigned timeframe, subject to the approval of a designated UME Associate Dean.
    - a. Voluntary Leaves of Absence may be granted in accordance with School of Medicine policies under the following circumstances:
      - i. Programmatic Leaves of Absence may be granted to allow students to participate in educational experiences at UCSF or other institutions or to appropriately time their graduation.
      - ii. Personal Leaves of Absence may be granted if a student requests time off for personal issues.
  - 2. Involuntary Leaves of Absence: An involuntary leave of absence is a separation of a student from the School of Medicine for reasons related to performance, with the expectation that a student will return to School of Medicine within an assigned timeframe having addressed performance issues.
    - a. Mandated Leaves of Absence
      - i. The Committee on Academic Standards may mandate a leave of absence for a student whose academic progress is unsatisfactory, as described in the UCSF Academic Senate Bylaws Appendix VII: 4.0 Step 2: In-Depth Review and Dismissal Action.
      - ii. In exigent circumstances, a designated associate dean may mandate a leave of absence for a student whose academic progress is unsatisfactory.
    - b. Administrative Leave of Absence
      - i. The Dean or designee may place a student on Administrative Leave of Absence if a student has engaged in or is alleged to have engaged in behavior that is dangerous or deleterious to the educational, research, clinical, or community environment.
  - 3. Return to the School of Medicine Following a Leave of Absence.
    - a. The School of Medicine may require that a student on a leave of absence meet specific criteria to reenter the curriculum. The Committee on Academic Standards or a designated associate dean may identify these criteria. Such criteria may include but are not limited to:
      - i. The requirement that a licensed professional attest that the student is able to meet the UCSF Technical Standards.
      - ii. The requirement for the student to meet specific academic readiness criteria.
    - b. Failure to meet required criteria may result in discontinuation without notice.
    - c. Regardless of the nature of the leave, all students must return from one or more leaves of absence in time to meet the School of Medicine time to graduation requirements.
- B. Permanent Separation of Student from the School of Medicine
  - 1. **Professional Disqualification** is an administrative action that permanently separates a student from the School of Medicine in accordance with the University of California 100.00 Policy on Student Conduct and Discipline.
    - a. Disqualification may result when the student is found to have manifested:
      - i. Non-academic misconduct, including but not limited to sexual misconduct, or manifest or threatened violence against any individual.
      - ii. Egregious breach of professional privileges including but not limited to improper advantage of professional relationships with patient or others.



- iii. Negligence in carrying out professional responsibilities.
  - iv. Egregious disrespect of or harm to the reputation of the UCSF.
  - v. Felony conviction.
  - b. Prior to disqualification, the student is entitled to procedural minima of due process, in accordance with the University of California 100.00 Policy on Student Conduct and Discipline.
    - i. At the discretion of the Dean or designee, students may be placed on administrative leave of absence during the due process proceedings.
  - c. Disqualification decisions are not subject to appeal beyond that afforded by university policy.
  - d. Students who are disqualified are not eligible for readmission to the School of Medicine.
2. **Discontinuance** is an administrative action taken by the School of Medicine that permanently separates the student from the school.
- a. Discontinuance is used for administrative circumstances in which the student fails to complete administrative requirements for registration, enrollment, matriculation, or course completion.
  - b. Discontinuance will result when a student:
    - i. Fails to register for any required term within one calendar month of its beginning date.
    - ii. Fails to report to the School of Medicine after a leave of absence.
    - iii. Fails to meet criteria for readmission and registration following a leave of absence.
    - iv. Withdraws from the School of Medicine without notice.
  - c. Discontinuance decisions are not eligible for appeal.
  - d. Students subject to discontinuance are eligible to apply for readmission in accordance to School of Medicine readmission policy.
3. **Dismissal** is an academic action taken by the School of Medicine that permanently separates the student from the School of Medicine.
- a. Dismissal may occur for any of the following reasons:
    - i. Student receives a non-passing grade while on academic probation.
    - ii. Student meets criteria for dismissal due to a pattern of unprofessional behavior as evidenced by excessive physicianship evaluation forms.
    - iii. Student is unable to meet the Technical Standards of the School of Medicine with or without institutionally approved accommodations.
      - a) Failure to seek or to use institutionally approved accommodations will not be accepted as sufficient grounds for circumventing this adverse academic action.
    - iv. Student's pace of progress in the MD curriculum precludes the completion of all required coursework for the degree of Doctor of Medicine within the maximum time to graduation designated by UCSF School of Medicine policy.
  - b. Students are entitled to appeal a dismissal decision in accordance with the UCSF Academic Senate Bylaws Appendix VII Section 5.0 Appeal.
  - c. Students dismissed from the School of Medicine are not eligible for readmission.
4. **Withdrawal** is a voluntary action taken by a student that results in permanent separation from the School of Medicine.
- a. Students may request a Withdrawal in Good Academic Standing if they would otherwise be eligible to continue in the curriculum.
    - i. Students who withdraw in good academic standing are eligible to apply for readmission in accordance to School of Medicine readmission policy.

- b. Students who are eligible for dismissal may only request a Withdrawal Not in Good Academic Standing.
  - i. Students who withdraw Not in Good Academic Standing are ineligible for readmission.
  - c. Withdrawal decisions are voluntary and thus are not eligible for appeal.
- C. All permanent separations of students from the School of Medicine are required by the Association of American Medical Colleges (AAMC) to be reported to the AAMC Student Records System.