University of California
San Francisco

UCSF

Academic Senate
senate.ucsf.edu

Committee on Equal Opportunity Retreat
Janice Tsoh, PhD, Chair

MINUTES
Monday, January 11, 2016

PRESENT: Janice Tsoh (Chair), Audrey Lyndon (Vice Chair), Paula Braveman, Linda Centore,
             Gordon Fung, Ryan Hernandez, Kathy Julian, Marguerita Lightfoot, Renee Navarro, Vice
             Chancellor, Diversity and Outreach (ex-officio)

GUEST(S):   Mitchell Feldman; Associate Vice Provost, Faculty Mentoring

The Committee on Equal Opportunity Retreat was called to order by Chair Tsoh on January 11, 2016 at
10:08am in room U506.

Approval of the December 12, 2015 Minutes
The minutes of the December 12, 2015 meeting were approved as amended.

Chair's Report
Chair Tsoh had these announcements:

Academic Senate Divisional Meeting: January 28, 2016, Rock Hall, 12pm
All faculty are invited and encouraged to attend the Divisional Meeting. The meeting will focus on space
planning issues at UCSF. Both the EVCP and the Chancellor will be in attendance. Interested faculty
should register here: https://www.eventbrite.com/e/january-2016-academic-senate-division-meeting-tickets-19916732483
Committee comments included:
- This is will adversely affect recruitment and retention, especially for diverse faculty.
- Senate Office should advertise that this has a space planning focus.

Statement of Support for the Muslim Community in Response to Global Incidents of Islamaphobia
EQOP's Statement of Solidarity was posted on the Senate website [LINK]. The Academic Senate
Coordinating Committee has endorsed the Statement. Vice Chair Lyndon presented our statement to the
SON DIVA committee and they wrote their own Statement of Solidarity [LINK]

Coordinating Committee
Jan 7th At the end of COORD, Lotz went over the implementation of 210(d).
   (1)   They are asking at least a prompt for diversity in Advance. So no box, but still a big step
           forward.
   (2)   Farid asked the question about acceleration – does diversity factor into acceleration. CAP
           said no. This is not extra credit, but helps on borderline.
AS Chair will be addressing retirement issues as things will be changing July 1st.
Feb 4th upcoming Coordinating Committee will be IT focused.

Full minutes of the Coordinating Committee can be found here.

Report from the University Committee on Affirmative Action, Diversity and Equity (UCAADE)
The next meeting is on January 25, 2016. Vice Chair Lyndon indicated that UCAADE will likely be discussing the draft memo circulated regarding targeting excellence for early career faculty how to employ the President's Postdoctoral Fellowship Program in the most beneficial manner. Vice Chair Lyndon had the opportunity to talk with Vice Chancellor Navarro regarding the Fellowship Program. She reported that our campus is elgilble for the start-up package, but not the FTE. It is the FTE that is the issue of contention. It may be that the FTE funding may have changed which is why this may be an opportune time to advocate for getting us an FTE.

Full minutes from UCAADE can be found here.

EQOP's Role in Assessing the Progress Towards Achieving Diversity on Campus
Chair Tsoh reviewed the EQOP's projects and the current status. (Appendix 1) She led a discussion on the initiatives:

Timeline for Bootcamp Criteria
A to-do item in terms of developing criteria either in conjunction with Alldredge or independently. Some ideas include requiring the funding to go to URM faculty, requiring feedback after attending. UCSD sponsors about 10 people and have criteria. Vice Chair Lyndon is part of the boot camp. It starts next week.

Committee comments included:
- Diversity training needs to make it through the ranks, down to course directors. To take this one step further, given the changing demographic, where are we going to be in 2020?
- We should be working towards having diversity a requirement on the CV, not just icing on the cake or extra credit. If we are looking towards the future, engagement regarding diversity should not be elective, but required.
  - This is a cultural shift that has yet to happen and there is concern that our approach should be nuanced so that there is not immediate backlash. CAP has already made a minor shift and we should continue with that collaboration and momentum.
  - This should be an overarching goal, not necessarily constrained to a year.
- Part of the strategy might be to continue our partnership with VPAA Alldrege, Vice Chancellor Navarro, and EVCP Lowenstein.

Implementation of APM 210(d) [Link]
Committee comments included:
- Implementation of APM 210(d) needs to remain as an agenda item. Next steps should include building consensus on our campus to present at the system-wide level.
- APM 210(d) can also be useful in training search committees and review panels. Where do assessments happen? How are packets being assessed? Once those individuals and processes are identified, they and their reviewing bodies should be trained. The Committee will work on strategies to implement these practices.
- Given the increasing number of diversity committees on campus, what are we doing to liaise better with all of these entitities.

Definition of Groups
EQOP's reevauluation of the term 'groups' germinated from a bylaw review in 2014. At that time, the Committee felt that the term underrepresented 'groups' should be further defined. Since the definition is dynamic, the committee spent some time trying to define what that term means today, but ultimately decided that rather than amending the bylaws to include every possible group, instead, the Committee will form guiding principles for the current committee. This way, future committees can continue to refine the definition without repeatedly changing the bylaws. Committee comments included:

Senate Staff:
Shilpa Patel, Senior Analyst
shilpa.patel@ucsf.edu; 415/514-2696

- Underrepresented groups differ based on geography.
- G. Fung commented that previously he had proposed to add LGBT, persons with disabilities, and historically disenfranchised groups. However, it then became a question about where would we get the data to support this? If we don't have the numbers, we don't have the correct insight. Chair Tsoh reminded the group that last year Elizabeth Ozer presented the data, so we should ask to see the numbers again this year. Specifically we should seek baseline data on who is represented at UCSF.
  - G. Fung noted that there are federal standards that we also need to adhere to. He proposed getting access to this information so that we can compare our campus data those federal standards.

Diversity Matters

Vice Chancellor Navarro is working across the campus to make sure that all diversity groups are working on the same initiatives. There is a master list of diversity leaders. Chair Tsoh suggested reviewing the list and inviting some of these leaders to our meetings .

Vice Chancellor Navarro commented that part of the challenge is to documenting all of the different intitiatives across the campus. As of last year, there are approximately 35 departmental diversity leaders that she meets with quarterly. A major part of their discussion focuses on implementation strategies and what are best practices for searches. How that group is going to best liaise with the deans is still to be determined. The goal is to keep duplicative processes to a minimum.

Faculty Handbook Revisions

L. Centore and K. Julian gave a brief overview of their work. Both serve on a joint subcommittee with the Committee on Academic Personnel (CAP) to oversee revisions to the Faculty Handbook [Link]. The subcommittee met briefly to go over the portions necessary for updating. In preparation, EQOP had created some examples of diversity contributions for each category in the CV for presenting at CAP. At the CAP subcommittee meeting there was already some thinking about diversity contributions, primarily due to the fact that this is part of UCSF's priorities and strategic plan. In July, CAP released some of their revisions. Those revisions incorporated many of EQOP's suggestions. EQOP subcommittee members were most interested in seeing the CV template, prompts for diversity, and what edits Associate Vice Provost Mitchell had in regards to mentoring.

Associate Vice Provost Feldman provided an update on current mentoring initiatives and possible collaboration with EQOP for overlapping work:
- Currently, he has funding to train mentors at all ten campuses which he is building off of an NSF Advance Grant.
- Given that there are several different processes going on, he would like to work together to ensure that all stakeholders are not redundant in verbage.
- He has formed a MAGIC group (Mentoring Advisory Group in California). This group is sharing resources across campuses and in the fall, will have a training from the National Research Mentoring Network [NRMN]. He encouraged anyone who is interested in being involved with this initiative to contact him.
- He is working with CAP and their concern over faculty whose packets indicate that they are off track. The goal is to improve mentor training such that faculty members land in the right series. Faculty need to be more proactive so that the remediation does not happen at the CAP level.
- The funding CAP received from Chancellor's fund will be applied towards mentorship. The first step will be to determine what is happening at the departmental level. CAP is using members who have rotated off to lead this charge.
- Instructions for the CV are being revised for clarity. Diversity contributions will be requested throughout, not just a paragraph.

- The handbook is a useful resource; however, since most faculty interact through Advance, whatever changes are being made in the handbook should be in alignment with what is in Advance.
- Initial changes to Advance should be introduced by July. He is currently working on updating the mentoring portion. In terms of the definition of mentoring, he found the NRNM definition a little more focused on research so settled on the definition developed by Lois Zachary. (Appendix 2)

Committee comments included:
- Advance should have an updated example of what the current CV looks like. The current one is from 2005. Examples for different tracks might be helpful as expectations differ for ladder rank and clinical faculty.
- What are other opportunities for people to find out about mentors? How do we link all of the resources? Some suggestions included: embedding a link in the handbook, utilizing the Diversity Hub on the ODO website, adding a prompt for mentoring/diversity contributions in the CV. See if this a place to add more information for faculty.
- Can we get mentoring data by race/ethnicity? AVP Mitchell will ask Wilson Hardcastle in the Office of Academic Affairs to pull that data.
- The teaching portion of the Handbook should say teaching and mentoring.
- Concerns regarding the term 'reciprocol' regarding mentoring: Shouldn't the burden heavier on mentor? AVP Mitchell clarified that reciprocal does not necessarily mean equal.
- It would be helpful to have his consistent definition for use across all sites.
- Under section F, Chancellor, Academic Senate, and Departmental committees related to diversity should be included.

Action Items:
(1) AVP Feldman will to send his Advance edits to S. Patel.
(2) Employing the use of the Diversity Hub.
(3) Mentoring data by race/ethnicity.
(4) AVP Feldman will send the mentoring definition to S. Patel.
(5) Angela Byars-Winston, PhD, associate professor, General Internal Medicine, will present at Grand Rounds on Thursday, January 14, 2016 at UCSF's University of California San Francisco's Mentoring Academy. The title of her presentation is, "Race Matters: Building the 21st Century Clinician, Educator and Scientist."

Collaboration with the Office of Diversity and Outreach (ODO)

Vice Chancellor Navarro reported on the following:
- The Chancellor's State of the University address again highlighted inclusion as a priority. There are several initiative in the works to further this priority:
  - **Improved Data Transparency**. To improve data transparency, the Chancellor will created a website that compares longitudinal data across the campus. VC Navarro will review the website and give feedback on how to better tell the story. As it stands, the data sharing initiative has data for faculty gender, faculty ethnicity, staff gender, staff ethnicity, student race, and student gender. At the school-level, we have faculty and staff data. The question is how to break down the data. EQOP suggested that at a minimum the data be broken down by race, ethinicity and gender. VC Navarro invited further input on how to make this data most robust and user friendly.
  - **Education and Training Initiatives**. As a first step, the Chancellor initially focused the education and training initiatives on the leadership, specifically, his direct reports. Two trainers were brought in to Then, at the department level, brought in diversity theater. Would like to collaborate with EQOP to move this initiative forward. Who do we focus on? Review committee members/panelists? How do we want to move this further? Analyst Patel is in working with ODO administrative staff to work on logistics. VC

Navarro discussed the prohibitive cost of renting a venue. Analyst Patel suggested applying for Academic Senate Faculty Engagement funds for location rental. VC Navarro indicated that a performance at Mission Bay should be considered due to the low turnout from basic scientists.

- **Equity Advisors**
  Equity Advisors will include senior faculty members who will be trained to help in the search process. The goal is to have a series of equity advisors -- one for SOD, SON, SOP, and three for SOM. There will be a stipend. Up to $12-15K. They would be engaged in the academic process, best practices, and engagement of the search committee chair. There will be some criteria (served on EQOP, CAP, etc.) and they will have access to training. Hoping to identify individuals by April or May. She would appreciate input on potential members.

- **Diversity Certificate**
  This came about in part because of the need for increased need for understanding diversity and LGBT issues. There would be an unconscious bias module and a module focusing on gender. Individuals would go through a six month training program. It might start out with staff competencies to help them get promoted. A faculty member from Psychiatry has been hired at 40% to develop the program. VC Navarro would like to get input from EQOP on the content as materials are developed.

- **Diversity Leaders**
  Vice Chair Lyndon wanted to find out who the diversity leaders are for each respective school. VC Navarro will pass that information on. In terms the resources, there is not a repository across all schools. The website is currently being redone and there is some discussion about using Sharepoint in the future.

- **Request for Data**
  Vice Chancellor queried how would EQOP like to see the data. Chair Tsoh indicated that the committee has been working towards a more intersectional perspective. Dr. Ozer brought data last year, but the Committee would like to drill down to school, series and rank.

Strategies Document
- This item is still on our agenda. The consensus was to make a two-pager.
- Vice Chancellor Navarro will have very specific guidelines and also detailed information regarding the equity advisors.
- There is a new document from General Counsel Charlie Robinson RE Prop 209. This information should be included.

Announcements
- On Wednesday at noon, there will be a discussion with Hospital Chaplains regarding care of Muslims
- On Friday, ODO will be hosting their 5 year celebration

Old Business
None.

New Business
None.

There being no further business, Chair Tsoh adjourned the meeting at 1:04 p.m.