



## Graduate Council

Youngho Seo, PhD, Chair

# ANNUAL REPORT

## 2013-2014

### Primary Focus Points for the Year:

- Self-Supporting Graduate Professional Degree Programs Policy (SSGPDPP)
- Proposal for a Faculty Postdoc Advisory Council
- Response to Program Review - Global Health Sciences Masters of Science Program
- Response to Program Review - PhD Program in History of Health Sciences
- Review of Master's of Science in Health Policy and Law Program Proposal
- Review of Doctor of Nursing Practice Program Proposal
- Review of PhD in Rehabilitation Science Program Proposal
- Guidelines for Review of New and Existing Academic Programs
- Review of PhD in Global Health Sciences Program Proposal

### Task Forces, Special Committees, and Sub-Committees:

- Doctor of Nursing Practice (DNP) (Richard Souza)
- Oral & Craniofacial Sciences MS Program Review (Karen Duderstadt)
- PhD in Rehabilitation Science (John Ziegler)
- Guidelines for Review of New and Existing Programs (Michele De Coteau, Youngho Seo, Janet Shim)

### Issues for Next Year (2014-2015)

---

#### 2013-2014 Members

---

**Youngho Seo, Chair**  
**Karen Duderstadt, Vice Chair**  
**and CCGA Representative**  
Pamela Den Besten  
Pam England  
Sunita Ho  
Anthony Hunt  
Mary Lynch  
Susan Miller

Jason Rock  
Mark Seielstad  
Janet Shim  
Richard Souza  
John Ziegler

#### **Ex-Officio Members**

Elizabeth Watkins, Dean, Graduate Division  
Christine Des Jarlais, Assistant Dean, Postdoctoral Affairs  
Melissa Hendershott, Graduate Student Association Representative

---

**Number of Meetings: 9**

**Academic Senate Analyst:** Kathleen Dargan

## Systemwide Business

The Graduate Council took up the following Systemwide issues this year:

### **CCGA Guideline for Degree Titles (SSP/PDST Programs) (Attached)**

CCGA circulated a draft proposal to require a new degree title to be created for professional degrees rather than “Master of Arts” or “Master of Science” in an effort to maintain the distinction between academic degree programs and professional degree programs.

### **Self-Supporting Graduate Professional Degree Programs Policy (SSGPDP)**

The council discussed proposed revisions to the 2011 self-supporting program (SSP) policy submitted by Provost and Executive Vice President, Aimee Dorr. The revised policy was created to establish, discontinue or set charges and requirements for establishing new self-supporting graduate professional degree programs as well as converting a state-supported graduate profession degree program to a self-supporting graduate professional degree. The Graduate Council submitted the following concern to the Coordinating Committee:

- This document could prevent UCSF from moving forward with the times.
- Not one person from UCSF on the drafting committee.
- At the UC Systemwide level, many people do not understand self-supporting programs, or the X and Y salary/HSCP structure. Aimee Dorr is the driving force behind this proposal. She is an educator. However health sciences education is different and would not be well served by the proposed policy
- A member of GC stated that she is working on a new SSP proposal and the changes in this document would impact her faith and loyalty to UC. This document is seemingly anti-UCSF.
- A question was raised whether the council could outright oppose this document.

The Council continued its review of the policy at its January 9, 2014 meeting. The line-by-line review brought out several issues that will be included in the final document. Two significant issues that are specific to UCSF were:

- 1) The draft policy states that SSPs “should be established by academic departments and staffed with ladder-rank faculty on the same basis as state supported programs”. UCSF has a variety of interdisciplinary programs that are not departmentally based and thus the statement should reflect this particular situation, especially in light of the fact that other campuses are also heading towards interdisciplinary graduate programs.
- 2) UCSF has a large proportion of faculty outside the ladder-rank series so the policy should be inclusive of other faculty tracks in the Academic Senate series that are qualified to teach and conduct research but are not in ladder-rank series such as In-Residence and Clinical X.

The Graduate Council proposed that the statement be changed to:

“Any self-supporting program should be established by academic departments or units and staffed with faculty in the Academic Senate series on the same basis as state supported programs.

A revised communication that includes several recommendations from the council was submitted to Academic Senate Chair, Farid Chehab.

### **Coordinating Committee on Graduate Affairs (CCGA)**

Committee Chair, Youngho Seo, attended Systemwide meetings on behalf of UCSF. Among items discussed were:

- A California Postsecondary Education Commission (CPEC) questionnaire is not required when submitting a new degree program proposal.
- There was discussion to create a new policy regarding the conversion of state-supported to self-supporting programs. CCGA currently has no clause that would allow this conversion.
- CCGA recommended that Master's degree capstone requirements be a comprehensive project and evaluated rigorously by at least two faculty reviewers when it is used instead of the traditional comprehensive examination or Master's thesis.
- Proposals involving PDST or SSP funding should be described as professional degree proposals and should, by default, use Master of X (professional specialization) rather than M.A. or M.S. unless a good justification is made to use M.A. or M.S.
- Composite Benefit rates – UC is attempting to make uniform rates of benefit expenses across the board. Faculty are concerned that composite rate, which could affect the fund that can be used for graduate student support.

## **Divisional Business**

This year, the Graduate Council took up the following issues related to the San Francisco Division:

### **Proposal for a Faculty Postdoc Advisory Council**

At the September 9, and October 13, 2013 meeting, Chris Des Jarlais presented a proposal to establish a "Faculty Postdoc Advisory Council" (FPAC) comprised of faculty who value the importance of postdoctoral contributions to the research enterprise and who believe that the training environment for postdocs at UCSF can and should be improved. The council approved the proposal to set up the council with the suggestion to "take baby steps" and submit progress reports to the Graduate Council throughout the process. The FPAC will not be an official subcommittee of the Graduate Council, but the Graduate Council will continue to have oversight of the FPAC in terms of shared governance. Council requested the removal of the statement of oversight in the proposal. Discussion of bylaw changes regarding oversight role of Graduate Council has been postponed.

### **Pathway Options for Course Review**

The Committee on Courses of Instruction (COCOI) made several changes to the current Academic Senate Course Review System (CRS), including the development of additional pathways for course review and approval. The COCOI is concerned that the Graduate Division has one person performing two of the three reviews required by the current pathway. Vice Chair Duderstadt requested a schematic of the course review system. The committee recommended including the course review pathway on the Academic Senate Course Review System website.

### **Response to Program Review - Global Health Sciences Masters of Science Program**

The GHS external review and letter from the Graduate Council noted the program's strengths and made recommendations regarding its weaknesses. The Council reviewed the response prepared by Global Health Sciences (GHS) Program Director John L. Ziegler, and Interim Graduate Program Director Madhavi Dandu. After discussing the response from Drs. Ziegler and Dandu, a motion was made to postpone approval of the GHS program review until GHS provides additional information in response to the concerns raised in the external review and the Graduate

Council. Following discussion of the response from Global Health Sciences, the council voted to conclude the program review at its December 12, 2013 meeting.

### **Response to Program Review - PhD Program in History of Health Sciences (HHS)**

The HHS external review and letter from the Graduate Council noted the program's strengths and made recommendations regarding its weaknesses. The Council reviewed the response from Brian Dolan, Director of Graduate Studies for the History of Health Sciences Program. After discussing the response from Dr. Dolan, a motion was made to postpone approval HHS program review until HHS provides additional information in response to the concerns raised in the external review and the Graduate Council. Following discussion of the response from Brian Dolan, the council voted to conclude the program review at its November 21, 2013 meeting.

### **Proposal to Establish a Graduate Program leading to a Master's of Science in Health Policy and Law Degree**

<https://ucsf.box.com/s/ocntdvuxov633ij5vi6o>

Dr. Daniel Dohan presented a proposal for a self-supporting master's degree program, Masters of Science Degree in Health Policy and Law (MS-HPL). This program will be a joint degree program between UCSF and UC Hastings. The program will provide both in-person/online and online-only option which will be administered through the Institute for Health Policy Studies and taught at the Laurel Heights Campus.

Dr. Dohan responded to the council's letter requesting addition information. The joint degree program between UCSF and UC Hastings intended to be an introduction to health policy and legal reasoning for health sciences and legal professionals who desire additional training.

At its December 12, 2013 meeting, the Council voted unanimously to approve the program proposal.

### **Proposal to Establish a Graduate Program leading to a Doctor of Nursing Practice (DNP) Degree**

Siting in the complicated process of getting buy-in from three additional campuses (UCI, UCLA and UCI), Annette Carley presented a pre-proposal with a request for guidance to assure the School of Nursing has performed sufficient rigor in preparing the program proposal. The program is a hybrid model that combines online courses and in-person training through designated home campus. Student enrollment will be equalized on each campus. Richard Souza was assigned as the lead reviewer of the proposal. Recommendations to enhance and strengthen the program, as well as a request for clarification of several points, were sent to Annette Carley.

The Graduate Council was concerned about the general philosophy of the program. The following issues were discussed:

- Length (short) of the program
- Venue (online program).
- Working and taking online courses to earn a doctorate degree.
- Should UCSF approve a program that would allow other UC schools (UCI, UCLA, and UCD) to join? All schools should review/approve concurrently.
- Supervision of capstone projects

The Council approved the proposal after review of the response at its April 10, 2014 meeting.

### **Future of Postdoc Training**

Graduate Council member, Anthony Hunt asked for a philosophical discussion on whether the University of California wanted to have standards of training for postdoctoral scholars. He noted that UCSF faculty teaching time is

distributed to both students in degree programs as well as to postdocs not enrolled in a degree program. Time and funds are being spent training postdocs and should be recognized as an official activity.

The council recommended that the Faculty Postdoc Advisory Council proposed by Christine Des Jarlais in October 2013, begin its work and consider taking up this concept. Council members volunteered to sit on a subcommittee by invitation rather than serving as a liaison to the Graduate Council.

### **Proposal to Establish a Graduate Program leading to a PhD in Rehabilitation Science**

Graduate Council reviewed a proposal for a PhD in Rehabilitation Science Degree, an interdisciplinary PhD program that addresses both basic and clinical sciences focusing on musculoskeletal and neurorehabilitation areas in collaboration with San Francisco State University. The Department of Physical Therapy and Rehabilitation Science currently offers both the Doctor of Physical Therapy (DPT) and Doctor of Physical Therapy Science (DPTSc). The proposal is to transition from DPTSc to PhD with the latter focusing on the academic research that is emphasized in traditional PhD programs. The council concluded that the program proposers had done their due diligence of developing the PhD program.

The Council voted to approve the PhD in Rehabilitation Science Program at its March 27, 2014 meeting. With approval from the Interim Chancellor, the program has been submitted to the CCGA for review at their July 2, 2014 meeting.

### **Revision to Bylaw 125**

The Graduate Council reviewed changes passed by the Task Force on Bylaw Changes and requested a few minor changes. The Council approved a motion to approve the changes to Bylaw 125.

### **Guidelines for Program Academic Review**

The guidelines for academic reviews of the graduate programs were updated to reflect recent changes in policy (e.g. new schedule for program reviews).

Dean Watkins noted that in light of recent WASC accreditation requirements, the programs' self-studies should include a statement and analysis of student learning outcomes.

Chair Seo requested that the CCGA recommendations for new program proposals regarding master's degree capstone requirements and the preferred titles for professional and academic master's degrees be included in the review guidelines.

### **Merit Fellowship Reviews – Wendy Winkler Sawyer**

There were eight merit award categories this year, with 29 individual awardees. The students were nominated by their programs, and the nominations were reviewed by the members of the Graduate Council.

### **Proposal to Establish a Graduate Program leading to a PhD in Global Health Sciences**

Based on the strength of its self-supporting MS degree program in Global Health Sciences, UCSF sought to establish the first University of California PhD degree in Global Health Sciences. The Council sent a communication to Dr. Molly Cooke requesting letters of support and clarification on the following issues:

- The numbers of units to be earned
- Why this is an academic PhD degree (distinction from DrPH)
- Length of rotation
- Effect of enrollment on the Master's Program

Anthony Hunt was assigned as the lead reviewer of the proposal. Recommendations and action items to improve the program were prepared and communicated to Dr. Cooke.

### **Review Process for New and Existing Programs**

Chair Seo and Michele de Coteau presented a collection of documents regarding the review process for new and existing programs, and revised and updated documents as a single packet for record-keeping. The document(s) will be included on the Graduate Division website. The Academic Senate website will provide the URL to the Graduate Division site. The council approved the documents with an option for minor edits.

### **Capstone Project**

The CCGA requested that all new Master's degree programs have a capstone element. If the capstone project is considered to meet the capstone element, the criteria for capstone projects need to be synthetic and comprehensive, and be evaluated for the individual effort of the degree candidate by at least two reviewers.

Chair Seo drafted a minor change to the Regulations and Procedures of the Graduate Council regarding the Requirements of Master's degree to reflect the capstone requirement.

The Council voted to approve the revised language to the Regulations and Procedures at its June 12, 2014 meeting.

## **Going Forward**

Ongoing issues under review or actions that the Committee will continue into 2014-2015:

- Doctor of Nursing Practice (DNP) Proposal Review
- Global Health Sciences (GHS) PhD Proposal Review

## **Appendices**

Academic Senate Analyst:  
Kathleen Dargan, Senate Analyst  
[Kate.Dargan@ucsf.edu](mailto:Kate.Dargan@ucsf.edu), 476-1308