Committee on Academic Personnel
Judy Yee, MD, Chair

ANNUAL REPORT
2013-2014

Total Files Reviewed: 390
Stewardship Reviews: 6 completed, 6 in progress, 2 on hold, 4 cancelled

Statistical Information:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total Files Reviewed</th>
<th>13-14</th>
<th>12-13</th>
<th>11-12</th>
<th>10-11</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Merits</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promotions</td>
<td>193</td>
<td>176</td>
<td>188</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accelerations</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decelerations</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Change In Series</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ad Hoc Committees</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Merits to Step 6</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appraisals</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Merits to Above Scale</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These numbers are not expected to calculate to the total files reviewed as a file may feature more than one descriptor, and these descriptors do not represent all forms of review.

Task Forces and Subcommittees:
- Judy Yee served on the Subcommittee to Review and Revise the “Criteria for Consecutive Advancement Guidelines”
- Judy Yee served on the Academic Senate Coordinating Committee

Issues for Next Year (2014-2015)
- Promotion and Advancement Criteria and Guidelines Review for Health Sciences Clinical Series – Task Force (Robert Rushakoff)
- Review and Creation of Standards for Faculty CV in Advance – Task Force (David Glidden and Lynn Pulliam)

2013-2014 Members

Judy Yee, Chair (SOM)       Jeffrey Lotz (SOM)
Arthur Miller, Vice Chair (SOD)  Octavia Plesh (SOD)
Linda Chafetz (SON)          Lynn Pulliam (SOM) & UCAP Representative
David Glidden (SOM)          Robert Rushakoff (SOM)
Steven Kayser (SOP)           (Thomas Kearney (SOP) Chair until Jan 2014)
Jacqueline Leung (SOM)        

Number of Meetings: 36
Senate Analyst: Alison Cleaver
Systemwide Business

Regarding system-wide concerns, the Committee (CAP) reviewed and responded to the system-wide Report from the Task Force on Senate Membership.

Proposed Revisions to Academic Personnel Manual (APM) Sections 133, 210, 220, 760

CAP members revised these proposed revisions which focus on expanding the reasons for stopping the eight-year service limitation clock (APM 133-17-g-j; APM 210-1-c; APM 220-18-b; APM 760-30-) and separately, on evaluating contributions to diversity (APM 210-1-d).

Overall UCSF CAP members supported all proposed revisions impacting stopping the eight-year service limitation clock. They had strong reservations on the proposed revisions to APM 210-1-d regarding evaluations contributions to diversity. Final campus recommendation will be forwarded onto UCOP by December 2014 – at which time it will be combined with review of the proposed APM Revisions conducted by the Faculty Welfare Committee (Appendix 1a).

Divisional Business

This year, Members of the Academic Senate Committee on Academic Personnel worked closely with the Vice Provost Academic Affairs Brian Alldredge and the Office of Academic Personnel on several policy issues.

Distinguished Faculty Awards: The Distinction In Teaching and the Distinction In Mentoring Awards

This year’s Distinction In Teaching Award Selection Committee was Chaired by CAP Chair Judy Yee, MD. The 2013-2014 recipients of the Distinction In Teaching Awards were Dr. Erick Hung, MD, Assistant Professor, Clinical Psychiatry (Category 1) and Dr. Alan Gelb, MD, Clinical Professor of Emergency Medicine, Department of Emergency Medicine, SFGH (Category 2).

This year’s Distinction In Mentoring Award Selection Committee was Chaired by David Glidden, PhD. The 2013-2014 recipients of the Distinction In Mentoring Awards were Michael Steinman, MD, Associate Professor in Residence, Division of Geriatrics, Department of Medicine (Category 1) and to Craig R. Cohen, MD, MPH, Professor In Residence, Obstetrics, Gynecology, & Reproductive Sciences (Category 2).

Chair Yee presented the awards to each of the recipients on April 23, 2014. The poster announcing the awards ceremony is attached as Appendix 1.

Proposed Revisions to Division Bylaw 110

The Committee on Academic Personnel received a Communication from the Academic Senate Bylaws Task Force with proposed CAP bylaw revisions for review at its September 25, 2013. Due to the nature and implications of such changes, CAP members opted to take a week to fully review.

Upon discussion at the October 2, 2013 CAP meeting, members proposed alternate bylaw revisions, to be developed once the committee analyst had reviewed all other UC campus CAP bylaws.

At the October 9, 2013, CAP meeting, members discussed their alternate bylaw changes with two members of the Bylaws Task Force. After discussion, CAP members asked the Senate CAP analyst to
make further amendments and submit to CAP for final review on the October 16 meeting a formal Communication from CAP to Rules & Jurisdiction Committee (Appendix 2).

Edits made to the Duties section were to correct the role of CAP at UCSF. This campus is one of the few in the UC System where CAP is not involved in reviewing or setting salaries. Changes were also made such that CAP’s duties are in line with language seen on the Academic Affairs (AA) website. Absent from the prior language were “reviews”. In addition to promotions and appointments, CAP is involved in "reviews" (defined by AA as Appraisals, Five Year Reviews, Career Reviews, and Stewardship Reviews).

Edits to the Annual Awards section were made to expand awards to include the Distinction in Mentoring (DIM) Award. The Committee on Academic Personnel has awarded this since 1958. It recently noted that language on the DIM Award was absent from committee bylaws.

**CAP Retreat**

The Committee held its annual retreat with the Vice Provost of Academic Affairs, Director of the Office of Academic Personnel, and the academic deans from the four schools on May 28, 2014. All CAP members were present except for R. Rushakoff who was excused. Also present were Brian Alldredge, Vice Provost Academic Affairs; Cynthia Leather, Director of the Office of Academic Personnel; Elena Fuentes-Afflick and Renee Binder, Associate Deans, Academic Affairs, School of Medicine; Peter Sargent, Associate Dean Academic Affairs, School of Dentistry; Shari Dworkin, Associate Dean, Academic Affairs, School of Nursing; Emerald Light, Manager of Academic Affairs; Gordon Fung, Equal Opportunity Committee Chair, Professor, Department of Medicine

Multiple issues were discussed, and the significant items are presented below.

**General CAP inquiries**

CAP members presented on expectations and requirements for advancements in the different series and at SFGH and VAMC. It was suggested that former CAP members and vice deans work with departmental mentoring or promotion/advancement committees to disseminate the information. Workshops of 20-25 people were considered ideal.

**Initial Appointments**

Letters in support of initial appointments should be complementary rather than a reiteration of the CV. Rank/series should not be used as a recruitment incentive if not appropriate. This may create difficulties down the road if the faculty is unable or unwilling to meet the rank/series expectations.

**Accelerations**

Requests for accelerations will now require one document. The previous procedure required two (one for the acceleration and one for the on-time). In addition, requests for consecutive accelerations will be reviewed by CAP.

**Stewardship Review Committee**

A new subcommittee was established to examine changes in policy relating to the logistics of attendance. Lynn Pulliam agreed to assist the committee with drafting the CAP document and the SRC Member document. Changes discussed included amendments to the CAP Responsibilities and the addition of Options. It was suggested that CAP representatives take on an oversight role in regards to attendance and other logistics. Any issues should be brought to the attention of the CAP Chair, AVP Leathers, Manager Light, and other staff at VPAA or VP as needed.

**Advance Phase IV**
Two CAP members were needed to serve on the CV committee.

Subcommittees for 2014-2015

One CAP member was requested to serve on HSC Policy Guidelines.

APM 278 is up for review this year. Members recommended Robert Rushakoff.

Evaluating Students of Color -- Equal Opportunity Chair Fung, and Senior Senate Analyst Patel

The council discussed teaching/instructing, research, professional activities, and university and public service as they relate to underrepresented minorities. Underrepresented students and faculty could receive additional training to improve research efforts. CAP should be aware of double reporting when making changes to the CV.

Task Forces and Other Committee Service

This year members of the Academic Senate Committee on Academic Personnel served on the following Academic Senate task forces or other campus committees as representatives of CAP or the Academic Senate.

• The Academic Senate Task Force on Academic Senate Membership
• Subcommittee to Review and Revise the Criteria for Accelerated Advancement in Rank Professorial Series
• Coordinating Committee

Going Forward

Ongoing issues under review or actions which the Committee will continue into 2014-2015:

• Promotion and Advancement Criteria and Guidelines Review for Health Sciences Clinical Series – Task Force
• Review and Creation of Standards for Faculty CV in Advance – Task Force

Appendices

Appendix 1a: CAP Communication to Division Chair Chehab in re APM Revisions
Appendix 1: Poster Announcing the 2014 Distinction In Teaching and Distinction In Mentoring Awards
Appendix 2: CAP Communication from CAP Chair Thomas Kearney to CRJ Chair Patrick Finley

Senate Staff: Alison Cleaver, Senior Analyst Alison.cleaver@ucsf.edu; 415/476-3808
June 19, 2014

Farid Chehab, PhD, Chair
UCSF Academic Senate
500 Parnassus Ave, MUE 231
San Francisco, CA

Cynthia Leathers, PhD
Assistant Vice Provost
Office of Academic Affairs
513 Parnassus Ave, MS 101
San Francisco, CA

Re: Proposed Changes to Systemwide APMs: 133-17-g-j; 210-1-c-d; 220-18-b; 760-30-a

Dear Chair Chehab and Assistant Vice Provost Leathers,


Proposed revisions focused on revisions of language on extending the eight-year limitation on service, and separately, on evaluating contributions to diversity.

Upon discussion at the June 4, 2014 and Jun 11, 2014 UCSF CAP meetings, the Committee offers the following responses:

On Revisions of Language on Extending the Eight-Year Limitation on Service
Overall, the Committee on Academic Personnel, UCSF, applauds these proposed changes.

In re APM-133-17-g-(3) and APM-760-25-30, committee members recognize that it is also incumbent upon the specific campus Academic Personnel Manuals to develop procedures to establish how a faculty member may seek to apply for an extension of the eight-year rule in cases of serious personal health, or illness of, or for bereavement of a family member, or other significant circumstance or event, and how the request will be evaluated.

UCSF CAP inquires if a timeline has been developed by when the respective campuses must have developed such procedures?
On Revisions of Language on Evaluating Contributions to Diversity

The Committee on Academic Personnel, UCSF, had strong objections to the proposed changes for APM 210-1-d and suggests the below new proposed revisions:

Current Systemwide Proposed Revisions: click here

New UCSF Proposed Revisions:

210-1 Instructions to Review Committees Which Advise on Actions Concerning Appointees in the Professor and Corresponding Series

d. Criteria for Appointment, Promotion, and Appraisal

The University of California is committed to excellence and equity in every facet of its mission. Contributions in teaching, mentoring, research, and other creative work, professional activity, and University and public service that promote diversity are to be encouraged. These contributions to diversity and equal opportunity can take a variety of forms including efforts to advance research, teaching, equitable access to education, and public service that addresses the needs of California’s diverse populations. Mentoring and advising of diverse students or new faculty members are to be encouraged and given due recognition in the teaching or service categories of the Academic Personnel process.

Justification for Proposed Revisions

(1) CAP members at UCSF found the final sentence redundant if the word ‘mentoring’ was added to the second sentence.

(2) Separately, the third and entirely new sentence was too open for interpretation for faculty to support it. Even within UCSF CAP itself, the sentence’s meaning was interpreted in widely disparate ways – that diversity efforts were to considered separate and equal to teaching, or mentoring, or research funding; or that diversity efforts were to be acknowledged as part of each component and not receive any separate praise—leading overall consensus to be that unless additional language is added to further delineate exactly how such a sentence is to be viewed, it should be removed entirely.

Overall UCSF Committee on Academic Personnel does not support diversity efforts being considered separate and equal to teaching, mentoring, research, and other creative work. It is already part of the UCSF effort that diversity be included in each component of the school mission – and listing them as a separate body of work is unnecessary.

Sincerely,

UCSF Academic Senate Committee on Academic Personnel
Judy Yee, MD, Chair
Arthur Miller, PhD, Vice Chair
Linda Chafetz, RN, PhD
David Glidden, PhD
Steven Kayser, PharmD
Jacqueline Leung, MD
Jeffrey Lotz, PhD
Octavia Plesh, DDS, MS
Lynn Pulliam, PhD
Robert Rushakoff, MD, MS
October 16, 2013

Patrick Finley, PharmD
Chair, Committee on Rule & Jurisdiction
Via email: finleyp@pharmacy.ucsf.edu

Re: Proposed Changes to Division Bylaw 110. Committee on Academic Personnel

Dear Chair Finley,

The Committee on Academic Personnel (CAP) recently received and reviewed proposed bylaw revisions to Division Bylaw 110., from the UCSF Academic Senate Bylaw Review Task Force. Upon discussion at the September 25, October 2, and October 9, 2013 CAP meetings, the Committee is proposing the below amended bylaw revisions to Division Bylaw 110.

Chair Slavotinek of the Bylaws Review Task Force attended CAP’s October 2, 2013 meeting, and Bylaws Review Task Force members Habelitz and Carlson attended the October 9, 2013 meeting to further discuss proposed revisions. Details of those meetings, if relevant, are detailed below.

Current Bylaw

110. Committee on Academic Personnel (http://senate.ucsf.edu/0-bylaws/bylaws.html#no110)

A. Membership: This committee consists of nine members of Professor rank including Tenure Track, Clinical-X and In-Residence series, serving staggered terms of three years. It shall contain members from each of the Division’s Schools and should be representative of the broad missions of UCSF, including members who are involved in the Basic, Clinical, and Social/Behavioral Sciences. [Am 1 Sep 03, 18 Nov 04]

B. Duties:

1. To make recommendations to the President and/or the Chancellor concerning appointments, promotions, salaries, policy and related matters. This Committee is to represent the Division in all matters relating to appointments and promotions. [Am March 01]

2. Annual Distinction in Teaching Award
   a. To receive nominations annually for recipients of awards of distinguished teaching from departmental chairs or from individual members of the faculty and from currently enrolled students. Nominations must be made to the committee on or before March first each year. It shall set up methods for inviting nominations.
   b. To convey to the Division annually its recommendations and establish procedures for wide publicity of the award. [Am 4 May 72, 16 May 78]

Proposed amendments (via tracked changes)

110. Committee on Academic Personnel

A. Membership: This committee consists of at least seven and no more than nine members of Professor rank in Tenure Track, Clinical-X and In-Residence series, serving staggered terms of three years. It shall contain members from each School and should be representative of the broad missions of UCSF, including members who are involved in the Basic, Clinical, and Social/Behavioral Sciences. [Am 1 Sep 03, 18 Nov 04, 16 October 13]

Alison Cleaver 10/11/13 12:30 PM
Alison Cleaver 10/11/13 12:31 PM
Formatted
Alison Cleaver 11/14/13 9:25 AM
Deleted: including
halden 9/12/13 5:24 PM
Deleted: of the Division’s
halden 9/12/13 5:24 PM
Deleted: s
b. This committee consists of up to two non-voting appointed members of the Professor rank in the Health Sciences Clinical or Adjunct Series who will serve for a term of three years each.

B. Duties:

1. To make recommendations to the President and/or the Chancellor concerning appointments, advancements, reviews, policy and related matters. This committee represents the Division in all such matters. The committee works in partnership with the Academic Affairs Office and provides weekly reports to the Vice Provost, Academic Affairs, on matters related to faculty file actions. [Am March 01, Am 16 October 13]

2. Annual Awards
   a. Distinction in Teaching Award: To receive nominations annually for recipients of awards of distinguished teaching from departmental chairs or from individual members of the faculty and from currently enrolled students. Nominations must be made to the committee on or before March first each year. It shall set up methods for inviting nominations.
   b. Distinction in Mentoring Award: A committee member will chair the Distinction in Mentoring Award selection committee with one member from each School at the Associate rank and one member from each School at the full Professor rank as appointed by the Committee on Committees.
   c. To convey to the Division annually its recommendations and establish procedures for publicity of the awards. [Am 4 May 72, 16 May 78]

Statement of Purpose for Proposed Amendments

In 2012, then-Division Chair Robert Newcomer convened the UCSF Academic Senate Bylaw Review Task Force to review the existing bylaws governing the San Francisco Division of the Academic Senate to propose administrative and substantive updates. The administrative review process corrected outdated references, grammar and other non-substantive issues. It was completed and approved by the Committee on Rules and Jurisdiction in March 2013. The Task Force is now working to address substantive content changes to improve consistency and clarity within the bylaws and to better align with the recently-passed Standing Rule to more effectively include all full-time faculty members in shared governance activities at UCSF.

The above proposed bylaw revisions are made after discussion with the Bylaws Review Task Force, and were developed with members of the TF in attendance at Committee on Academic Personnel meetings.

The amendments proposed above include:

1. Modify the number of Senate and non-Senate/non-voting members on the Committee on Academic Personnel.
2. Clarify the line of reporting for and partnership between Committee on Academic Personnel and Academic Affairs Office
3. New section B. 2. b. provides language to govern the Distinction in Mentoring Award, not currently documented within the Committee’s bylaws.
4. Track changes in red are proposed by CAP. Those in blue were proposed by the Academic Senate Bylaws Task Force and approved by CAP.

Justification

Membership

Edits related to the Membership section were made to maintain an odd-number of members on the Committee while adding non-Senate faculty. The Committee regularly examines both Senate and non-Senate faculty up for promotion, advancement or reviews. Inclusion of such non-Senate faculty, as non-voting members, will assist the committee in its assessment of such files.
The Committee on Academic Personnel notes that per Systemwide Senate Bylaw 35.C.2 addressing “Voting and Other Rights” of Senate committees, the addition of non-Senate members would only be in compliance if they were added in the form of non-voting members. It is the intention of the Committee on Academic Personnel to remain in compliance while making these changes.

Systemwide Senate Bylaws
35. Membership of Committees
C. Voting and Other Rights

2. Only members of the Academic Senate may vote in Senate agencies and their committees when those agencies or committees are taking final action on any matter for the Academic Senate, or giving advice to University officers or other non-Senate agencies in the name of the Senate. Persons other than Senate members may be given the right to vote on other questions, such as those that involve only recommendations to other Senate agencies, but only by explicit Bylaw provisions. [See Legislative Ruling 12.75]

Duties
Edits made to the Duties section were to correct the role of CAP at UCSF. This campus is one of the few in the UC System where CAP is not involved in reviewing or setting salaries. Changes were also made such that CAP's duties are in line with language seen on the Academic Affairs (AA) website. Absent from the prior language were “reviews”. In addition to promotions and appointments, CAP is involved in “reviews” (defined by AA as Appraisals, Five Year Reviews, Career Reviews, and Stewardship Reviews).

Annual Awards
Edits to the Annual Awards section were made to expand awards to include the Distinction in Mentoring (DIM) Award. The Committee on Academic Personnel has awarded this since 1958. It recently noted that language on the DIM Award was absent from committee bylaws.

Background
The Committee on Academic Personnel received a Communication from the Academic Senate Bylaws Task Force with proposed CAP bylaw revisions for review at its September 25, 2013. Due to the nature and implications of such changes, CAP members opted to take a week to fully review.

Upon discussion at the October 2, 2013 CAP meeting, members proposed alternate bylaw revisions, to be developed once the committee analyst had reviewed all other UC campus CAP bylaws.

At the October 9, 2013 CAP meeting, members discussed their alternate bylaw changes with two members of the Bylaws Task Force. After discussion, CAP members asked Senate CAP analyst to make further amendments and submit to CAP for final review on the October 16 meeting a formal Communication from CAP to Rules & Jurisdiction Committee.

If so requested, a member of the Committee on Academic Personnel (CAP) is happy to attend an upcoming Rules & Jurisdiction Committee meeting to discuss proposed bylaw revisions.

The Committee on Academic Personnel thanks you for your review of these proposed changes.

Sincerely,

UCSF Academic Senate Committee on Academic Personnel
Thomas Kearney, PharmD, Chair
Judy Yee, MD, Vice Chair
Linda Chafetz, RN, PhD
David Glidden, PhD