Report from the Committee on Academic Planning & Budget: Proposed Modifications to the Health Sciences Compensation Plan (APM Sections 025 and 670)

March 4, 2011

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Committee on Academic Planning and Budget proposes revision of APM-670: Health Sciences Compensation Plan and Guidelines on Occasional Outside Professional Activities for Health Sciences Compensation Plan Participants. Changes are designed to mitigate the effects of continuing declines in salary compensation and looming new expenses for post-employment benefits, to foster a work environment that supports professional excellence and growth, and to restore parity between professional schools and general campuses on occasional outside activities.

Recommendations for implementation on or before 1 July 2013:

1. **Compensation Limit on Occasional Outside Professional Activities:** The maximum annual earnings threshold is set at $40,000 (currently $20,000) or 20% of the Health Sciences Compensation Plan (Plan) Salary Scale for the faculty member’s rank, step, and academic programmatic unit, whichever is greater (APM-670 Guidelines on Occasional Outside Professional Activities, Section II.C.4.c, Page 6).

2. **Time Limit on Compensated Outside Professional Activities:** A full-time Plan member may engage in compensated outside professional activities for up to 48 days during the months of active service. There are no restrictions on the number of days of compensated outside activity during the periods of vacation leave (unless the faculty member is earning additional University compensation during the vacation leave). This is express adoption of APM-025 Conflict of Commitment and Outside Activities of Faculty Members, Section 10.b, Page 6 for Plan members.

3. **Categories of Income from Occasional Outside Activities Which May Be Retained.** Plan members in good standing may retain income from occasional outside patient care and from professional activities related to the training and experience which are the individual’s qualifications for University appointment, subject to the new limits on compensation and time described above. This broadens the categories of retainable income from occasional service specified in APM-670 Health Sciences Compensation Plan, Section IV.D, Page 7.
JUSTIFICATION FOR REVISION OF APM-670

1. Faculty Recruitment and Retention. The current Health Sciences Compensation Plan (Plan) was approved by the Regents in 1999 for all University of California health sciences campuses. Since 1999, the cost of living in the San Francisco Bay Area has increased, while support for higher education from the State of California has decreased. UCSF salaries are stagnant, and mandatory furloughs further reduced income. Faculty will soon be faced with a new cost in funding retirement that will reduce take-home pay and benefits compensation at the time of separation. These factors, and UCSF restrictions and expenses such as space allocation and information technology costs, make it difficult to recruit new high-quality faculty and retain current faculty offered more competitive positions with substantial infrastructure support in less expensive geographic regions. The proposed modifications to the Health Sciences Compensation Plan have two key components to remedy this threat to our University. First, the increase in earnings threshold from $20,000 to $40,000 and increase in time from 21 to 48 days will help retention and recruitment by augmenting income for those with established outside compensation opportunities. Second, the change in policy on categories of income from occasional outside activities which may be retained to expressly include patient care and other professional activities related to the training and experience that are qualifications for University appointment will help to enable realization of new income for Plan members who currently are without established outside compensation opportunities. The proposed modifications will mitigate ongoing salary compensation decline for as many Plan members as possible, not just those with existing sources of outside income.

2. Professional Competence. UCSF prides itself on having outstanding clinicians, educators, and scientists. However, the Plan does not allow income from occasional outside professional activities related to the training and experience which are the individual’s qualifications for University appointment. Our training environment makes it difficult for faculty clinicians to perform procedures on a frequent basis, and the tertiary care environment may limit exposure to a wide range of cases. Outside clinical experiences can complement the retention of procedural skills and medical knowledge. Faculty members whose role at UCSF is primarily to educate in the classroom cannot provide clinical care for specific patient populations needed to maintain their specialty certification, and are barred from sharing their knowledge through compensated teaching or research activities at other universities. Students and trainees who prize community-based experiences to learn “real-life” solutions to medical problems and create opportunities for research are disadvantaged because stringent limitations imposed on university-based UCSF faculty who wish to also practice in the community have become counterproductive. Thus, Plan restrictions impede the very best clinical care, patient safety, education, and research.

3. Parity with General Campuses. Full-time faculty on fiscal-year appointments at University of California general campuses may engage in compensated outside activities for up to 48 days during the months of active service (APM-025 Conflict of Commitment and Outside Activities of Faculty Members, Section 10.b, Page 6). Category I activities are those likely to raise issues of conflict of commitment. To engage in Category I activities, faculty members at general campuses make written requests to the Chancellor or designee and receive written approval (APM-025 Conflict of Commitment and Outside Activities of Faculty Members, Section 10.c, Page 7).

   In contrast, Plan participants at health sciences campuses are allowed to retain payments from only 21 days of outside service per fiscal year under the University-wide Standard
Requirement (APM-670 Guidelines on Occasional Outside Professional Activities, Section II.B, Page 2). Chancellors may request approval from the President for Plan participants to retain income from compensated teaching or research at outside institutions or from more than 21 days of allowed professional activities (APM-670 Guidelines on Occasional Outside Professional Activities, Section II.C.1, Page 3). In no case are Plan participants allowed to retain income from patient care (APM-670 Guidelines on Occasional Outside Professional Activities, Section II.C.3, Page 4). Furthermore, the maximum annual outside professional earnings threshold is set at $20,000 or 20% of the Health Sciences Compensation Plan Salary Scale for the faculty member’s rank, step, and academic programmatic unit, whichever is greater (APM-670 Guidelines on Occasional Outside Professional Activities, Section II.C.4.c, Page 6). In its current form, the Plan does not provide parity with general campus policies and must be revised as described in APM-670 Health Sciences Compensation Plan, Section II, Pages 3-4.

4. Community, Foundation, and Corporate Partnerships. Plan restrictions on the amount and type of work performed during personal time are so severe that a UCSF faculty member in good standing may avoid compensated outside activities altogether. Individual decisions like these have far-reaching consequences for the University as a leader in patient care, education, and biomedical research. Lost opportunities to form professional relationships with patients and families at outside facilities impair referrals and charitable giving. The proposed modifications to the Plan would benefit the University in several ways. Teaching and curriculum development performed at other universities influence public health policy and enhance recruitment of talented and diverse students to UCSF’s health sciences and professional training programs. Collaborations with research groups at other centers generate innovation, donations, and in-kind support for activities at UCSF. At a time when reimbursements for patient care, state support for education, and federal funding for science are uncertain, the Plan must be updated to enhance compensated outside activities for faculty and thereby promote community, foundation, and corporate partnerships for UCSF.

SPECIFIC REVISIONS OF APM-670

1. Compensation Limit on Occasional Outside Professional Activities


Current Plan:

Effective with the issuance of these guidelines, the maximum annual outside professional earnings approval threshold set by the President shall be $20,000 or 20 percent of the Health Sciences Compensation Plan salary scale for an individual member’s rank, step, and academic programmatic unit, whichever is greater.
Proposed Changes:

Effective with the issuance of these guidelines, the maximum annual outside professional earnings approval threshold set by the President shall be $40,000 or 20 percent of the Health Sciences Compensation Plan salary scale for an individual member’s rank, step, and academic programmatic unit, whichever is greater.

Final Version:

Effective with the issuance of these guidelines, the maximum annual outside professional earnings approval threshold set by the President shall be $40,000 or 20 percent of the Health Sciences Compensation Plan salary scale for an individual member’s rank, step, and academic programmatic unit, whichever is greater.

2. University-wide Standard Requirement

APM-670 Guidelines on Occasional Outside Professional Activities by Health Sciences Compensation Plan Participants, Section II.B, Page 2.

Current Plan:

The University-wide standard requirement is that Plan participants shall be allowed to retain payments from 21 days of service (other than patient care) per fiscal year to governmental agencies, to non-profit health- or education-related organizations, to continuing health education programs administered by the University, or University Extension, if such service has been approved by the Dean and the Chancellor.

Proposed Changes:

The University-wide standard requirement is that full-time Plan participants shall be allowed to retain payments for up to 48 days of service per fiscal year to governmental agencies, to health- or education-related organizations, to continuing health education programs administered by the University, or University Extension, if such service is approved by the Dean and the Chancellor. There are no restrictions on the number of days of compensated outside activity during the periods of vacation leave (unless the faculty member is earning additional University compensation during the vacation leave).

Final Version:

The University-wide standard requirement is that full-time Plan participants shall be allowed to retain payments for up to 48 days of service per fiscal year to governmental agencies, to health- or education-related organizations, to continuing health education programs administered by the University, or University Extension, if such service is approved by the Dean and the Chancellor. There are no restrictions on the number of days of compensated outside activity during the periods of vacation leave (unless the faculty member is earning additional University compensation during the vacation leave).
3. **Other Miscellaneous Income Which May be Retained by Plan Members**

*APM-670 Health Sciences Compensation Plan, Section IV.D, Page 7.*

Current Plan:

Certain categories of income accruing from occasional service, as described below, may be retained by Plan members. The Department Chair and/or Dean shall monitor the frequency of individual activity in these areas:

1. Income from occasional outside professional activity (other than patient care) in accordance with the Guidelines on Occasional Outside Professional Activities by Health Sciences Compensation Plan Participants issued by the President and campus implementing procedures.

Proposed Changes:

Certain categories of income accruing from occasional service, as described below, may be retained by Plan members. The Department Chair and/or Dean shall monitor the frequency of individual activity in these areas:

1. Income from occasional outside professional activity, including patient care and professional activities related to the training and experience which are the individual's qualifications for University appointment, in accordance with the Guidelines on Occasional Outside Professional Activities by Health Sciences Compensation Plan Participants issued by the President and campus implementing procedures.

Final Version:

Certain categories of income accruing from occasional service, as described below, may be retained by Plan members. The Department Chair and/or Dean shall monitor the frequency of individual activity in these areas:

1. Income from occasional outside professional activity, including patient and professional activities related to the training and experience which are the individual's qualifications for University appointment, in accordance with the Guidelines on Occasional Outside Professional Activities by Health Sciences Compensation Plan Participants issued by the President and campus implementing procedures.
The APB Subcommittee Proposing Modification to the
Health Sciences Compensation Plan
Mary Gray, MD, Chair
Steven Cheung, MD
Kimberly Topp, PhD, PT
Ellen Weber, MD

The Committee on Academic Planning and Budget
Steven Cheung, MD, Chair
Mary Gray, MD, Vice Chair
Frances Brodsky, PhD
Mary Engler, PhD, RN, MS, FAHA
Barbara Gerbert, PhD
Ruth Greenblatt, MD
Nancy Hessol, MSPH
Shelley Hwang, MD
Peggy Leong, DMD, MBA
Wendy Max, PhD
Ida Sim, MD, PhD
Michael Steinman, MD
Jonathan Strober, MD
Kimberly Topp, PhD, PT
Candy Tsourounis, PharmD

Marcia Wadell, DDS, MS
Ellen Weber, MD
Daniel Weiss, PhD
Elad Ziv, MD
John Plotts
Robert Newcomer, PhD
Sally Marshall, PhD
Lori Yamauchi, MCRP

With Permanent Guests:
Elazar Harel, PhD (CIO)
Janice Lee, DDS, MD (SOD-FC)
Heather Fullerton, MD, MAS (SOM-FC)
Meg Wallhagen, RN, PhD, GNP (SON-FC)
Norman Oppenheimer, PhD (SOP-FC)