COMMITTEE ON ACADEMIC FREEDOM
Stuart Gansky, DrPH, Chair

MINUTES
Thursday, May 17, 2007
9:00 – 10:30 a.m., Room S-118

Present: S. Gansky, Chair, Elizabeth Boyd, Descartes Li, Victor Reus,

Excused: C. Anthony Hunt, Miriam Kuppermann, Mary White, Maurice Zwass

Absent: J. Lightwood

The April 19, 2007 meeting of the Committee on Academic Freedom convened at 9:10 in Room S-118. A quorum was not present.

Approval of Minutes

The minutes of the meeting on April 19, 2007 were approved by e-mail vote.

Chair’s Report – Stuart Gansky

The Task Force on Vendor Relations evaluated three issues raised by the Brennan Report that were not addressed explicitly by the current UCOP Proposed Guidelines and made the following recommendations.

1. **Ghostwriting by vendor employees.**
The Task Force defined ghostwriting as writing an article but not appearing as a co-author on the article. They recommended that faculty be discouraged from this practice. It was also recommended that the authors of publications have access to the complete, accurately reported data set and analysis for all papers on which they are authors.

2. **“No strings attached” grants or gifts.**
The Task Force felt that totally unrestricted or unconditional gifts should be prohibited - that gifts to individual faculty members from vendors must come through University channels via gift administration and development departments. These gifts must be specified as to their purpose, e.g. support of research or education by the recipient to ensure that the funds are used in compliance with existing University policies.

3. **Consulting agreements and unconditional grants.**
The Task Force was strongly in favor of the effort to increase transparency for University faculty with respect to consulting agreements. They indicated that the compensation plan disclosure forms provide the ability for the departments to evaluate the activities of individual faculty members for
potential conflicts of interest. Other conflict of interest disclosure forms required of faculty provide additional University oversight. They encourage all faculty members to disclose their relationship(s) with the vendor(s) in publications and public lectures. The Task Force, however, did not support additional public listing of such agreements.

A Communication has been sent to Chair of the Academic Senate, Deborah Greenspan.

**University Committee on Academic Freedom (UCAF) Report – Chair Gansky for Miriam Kuppermann**

In a communication dated February 21, 2007, to the UC Research Integrity Officers, Jerold Theis, Chair of the University committee on Academic Freedom, requested information regarding the campuses misconduct in research policies and statistics. It was noted that no report has been submitted from the UCSF campus.

**ACTION:** Check with Randy Lopez.

(NOTE to Committee: In reviewing the communication, while it is not clear who is responsible for this communication, the only UCSF-affiliated name appearing in the memo is Clifford Roberts, DVM, Interim, Associate Vice Chancellor.)

**Task Force on Open Access Policy – Chair Gansky for Jim Lightwood**

The Task Force on Open Access was strongly supported the policy that would greatly improve the ability of researchers to share their finding while not transferring all of the rights for use of their work to the commercial publisher, faculty authors will be able to publish their work on open-access, non-commercial repositories. Such a policy would greatly improve the ability of researchers to advance their own research and education goals as well as those of the University. The Task Force felt an “opt out” option was the most in keeping with protecting the faculty member.

A Communication was sent to Academic Senate Chair Deborah Greenspan.

**Symposium in Politicization of Science**

The Academic Freedom Symposium, presented by Professor Paul Berg, entitled “Brilliant Minds, Dark Politics, Uncertain Law”, will take place on June 5, 2007. Professor Berg, from Stanford University, is a Nobel Laureate (Chemistry, 1980).

**Extramural Fund Overruns**

Chair Gansky presented five questions regarding extramural grant fund overspending to the Committee. With minor changes, these questions will be presented, at the request of Vice Chair Gardner, to the June 12, 2007 Academic Senate Coordinating Committee meeting. The Coordinating Committee will have the opportunity review these questions and determine a course of action, including the focus of any Senate investigation and the appropriate Committees to be involved.

**New Business**

None

**Old Business**

None
The meeting was adjourned at 10:20 a.m.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Committee Member</th>
<th>9/12/06</th>
<th>10/10/06</th>
<th>11/21/06</th>
<th>12/19/06</th>
<th>1/18/07</th>
<th>2/22/07</th>
<th>3/22/07</th>
<th>4/19/07</th>
<th>5/17/07</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Stuart Gansky (Chair)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>Cancelled</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jim Lightwood</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>EX</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elizabeth Boyd</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>EX</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>EX</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Anthony Hunt</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>EX</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miriam Kuppermann</td>
<td>EX</td>
<td>EX</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>EX</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Descartes Li</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victor Reus</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
<td>EX</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mary White</td>
<td>EX</td>
<td>EX</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>EX</td>
<td>EX</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>EX</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maurice Zwass</td>
<td>EX</td>
<td>EX</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>EX</td>
<td>EX</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>EX</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

X – Attended
A – Absent
EX – Absent, excused

Prepared by:
Kathleen Dargan
Senate Analyst/Coordinator
476-1308
kdargan@senate.ucsf.edu
www.ucsf.edu/senate