The meeting of the Committee on Academic Freedom convened at 9:09 a.m. on Tuesday, February 15, 2005 in Room S30. A quorum was not present.

Approval of Minutes

P. Braveman moved to approve the minutes of the meeting of January 18, 2005. P. Braveman, M. Eisner, and J. Lightwood all voted to approve the minutes with no changes. The Committee agreed to finalize the vote on this item via e-mail since a quorum was not present.

Update on Resolution Relating to Restrictions on Research Funding

J. Lightwood, the Committee on Academic Freedom’s representative to the Task Force reviewing the UCORP Resolution Relating to Restrictions on Research Funding, reported that he communicated the following concerns to the Task Force on behalf of the Committee:

- In the estimation of the Committee on Academic Freedom, the current language of the Resolution goes too far in prohibiting any group of faculty from expressing a view with respect to funding sources. Several non-governmental organizations have adopted policies which restrict grants to institutions that do not refuse funding from certain industries. As written, the Resolution would prevent units from accepting funding from certain sources by prohibiting the units from complying with the funding policies of those sources. For example, the American Legacy Foundation “will not award a grant to any applicant that is in current receipt of any grant monies or in-kind contribution from any tobacco manufacturer, distributor, or other tobacco-related entity.” The UCORP Resolution may prevent units of the University from accepting Legacy Foundation funds because units would be unable to implement policies prohibiting receipt of funding from the tobacco industry.

- The Committee is also concerned that the Resolution as drafted may compromise the credibility of the University and ultimately undermine the faculty’s ability to conduct research. There are two prongs to this problem. First, as explained above, the Resolution may actually work to decrease funding opportunities where the University is unable to comply with certain organizations’ funding policies. In turn, reduced funding may limit the
amount of research faculty can produce. The second prong has to do with protecting the integrity of the academic process. The Committee is concerned that the Resolution may create a perception that the work of the University is tainted by funding from certain industries. This will erode the credibility of the University and especially UCSF as a health science institution.

J. Lightwood made it clear to the Task Force that the Committee on Academic Freedom has significant problems with the language of the Resolution as it currently stands. The Task Force plans to produce a report for UCSF Divisional Chair Zegans by March 1, 2005 that will include findings and recommendations related to the Resolution. Chair Eisner suggested that the Committee ask to review the report prior to its completion and request that the Committee’s positions and feedback be reflected therein. Chair Eisner will contact the Chair of the Task Force and Chair Zegans regarding these requests.

**Continued Discussion of Symposium on “Science, Government and Academic Freedom in a Polarized Political Environment”**

Chair Eisner informed the Committee that to date, only two invitees, Donald Kennedy of Stanford and Raymond Zalinskas of the Monterey Policy Institute, have confirmed their availability to participate in the planned April 26, 2005 symposium. Invitees Marye Anne Fox, Elizabeth Blackburn, and Henry Waxman declined the invitation, citing previous commitments. The Committee has not yet received a response from Dean Kessler. Chair Eisner and/or Chair Zegans will follow up with a phone call.

The Committee discussed the desire to secure at least four speakers in order for the symposium to attract sufficient interest. The Committee thus generated a new “short list” of potential invitees who will be contacted to determine availability to participate. Chair Eisner reminded the Committee that the budget is limited for coverage of speaker travel expenses. He will review the short list of additional speakers with Chair Zegans during the Academic Freedom Mid-Year Meeting on February 17, 2005.

**Old Business**

Chair Eisner inquired about the status of the formation of an Academic Freedom panel of advisors. The Senate Office will compile a list of past Committee members in order to facilitate discussion/selection of proposed panel members at the next meeting.

**New Business**

None.

*The meeting adjourned at 9:42 a.m.*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Committee Member</th>
<th>09/22</th>
<th>10/19</th>
<th>11/16</th>
<th>12/21</th>
<th>01/18</th>
<th>02/15</th>
<th>03/15</th>
<th>04/19</th>
<th>05/17</th>
<th>06/21</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mark Eisner (Chair)</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stuart Gansky (Vice-Chair)</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>Excused</td>
<td>Absence</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paula Braveman</td>
<td>Excused</td>
<td>Absence</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Excused</td>
<td>Absence</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Excused Absence</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>Excused Absence</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stephen Gitelman</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jim Lightwood</td>
<td>Excused Absence</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Howard Pollick</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>Excused Absence</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Excused Absence</td>
<td>Absent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victor Reus</td>
<td>Excused Absence</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Excused Absence</td>
<td>Excused Absence</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meg Wallhagen</td>
<td>Excused Absence</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>Excused Absence</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Excused Absence</td>
<td>Excused Absence</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Prepared by:
Alice Kessler
Senate Analyst/Coordinator
476-8827 / akessler@senate.ucsf.edu