

**Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion (DEI), Anti-Oppression, and Anti-Racism Initiative
Committee on Courses of Instruction (COCOI)**

Approved December 13, 2022

I. Background

A. Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion (DEI) are part of UCSF's core PRIDE values. The UCSF Academic Senate has established the advancement of DEI, Anti-Oppression and Anti-Racism at UCSF as a priority. The Committee on Courses of Instruction (COCOI) regards the thoughtful application of the concepts of DEI, Anti-Oppression and Anti-Racism (DEI-AO-AR) to courses as both necessary for creating an inclusive learning environment that supports equity in the experiences of diverse learners and as essential to the institution's responsibility to the broader society that students who take these courses will eventually serve. Within the context of UCSF's mission of *Advancing Health Worldwide*, this responsibility includes seeking out and recognizing disparities and partnering with future patients to provide equitable and inclusive healthcare and countering long-standing structurally oppressive and racist healthcare systems and practices in order to help us move toward a more equitable and just system for all patients and communities.

B. Definitions

Definitions in bold are taken from the UCSF Foundations of DEI Training

1. **Diversity** reflects differences in individual identity, such as, self-identified or perceived race and ethnicity, nationality, gender, LGBTQ, disability, and socio-economic status. Achieving diversity requires *understanding people, their varied experiences, and how we empower them to be authentic members of our community, including, a) celebrating the values of our differences, resisting and counteracting the tendency of those with privilege and/or power to determine norms that are oblivious, indifferent, opposed to, or violent toward other people and c) deliberately and relentlessly promoting spaces and processes that invite, encourage, embrace, defend, and celebrate different ways of feeling and thinking.* (Hoyt, 2018).

Diversity refers to the variety of personal experiences, values and worldviews that arise from differences of culture and beliefs. Such differences include race, ethnicity, gender, age, religion, language, abilities/disabilities, sexual orientation, gender identity, socioeconomic status, and geographic region, and more. (Adopted from the University of California Regents Policy 4400: Policy on University of California Diversity Statement)

2. **Equity** reflects recognizing that each person has different circumstances and allocating the exact resources and opportunities needed to reach an equal outcome. Equity differs from equality, which refers to a state or outcome that is the same among different groups.
 - **Equity is when two or more groups have parity or are on relatively equal standing.**
 - **Whereas equality attempts to distribute resources in the same manner across groups, equity acknowledges that groups are positioned differently across systems and therefore may require different resources.**
 - **To achieve equity resources should be distributed in a manner that creates access for everyone.**
3. **Inclusion** reflects establishing a culture of belonging by actively inviting contribution in such a way that allows for authentic and empowered participation of all people. Inherent to inclusion is accessibility, which requires the proactive application of general solutions that allow greatest access regardless of ability.

Inclusion is best demonstrated through the behaviors, actions and policies in our institution that support its members and their ability to fully participate and engage.

- **An inclusive environment is one in which everyone is welcomed, supported, respected, and valued.**
- **We must support the creation of structures of inclusion that recognize and accommodate difference rather than seek to erase it.**
- **When the community is inclusive, its members can show up as their full selves, participate and actively engage.**
- **“Diversity is being invited to the party; inclusion is being asked to dance”.**
(Verna Myers)

4. **Anti-oppression** reflects the practice of actively identifying and challenging systems, policies and practices of oppression, where oppression refers to the intentional use of power to produce inequity through mechanisms, such as, disenfranchisement, disempowerment, marginalization, silencing, subordinating or otherwise disadvantaging groups of people based on their identity, often while advantaging members of a dominant group.
5. **Anti-racism** reflects the practice of being an anti-racist. Being anti-racist is not simply passively considering one’s self as not racist or only denouncing racism. Rather being anti-racist means taking courageous and proactive steps to actively identify, challenge and eliminate racism at individual, institutional, and systemic levels by changing policies, behaviors, and beliefs that perpetuate racist beliefs, ideas and actions. “One either believes problems are rooted in groups of people, as a racist, or locates the roots of problems in power and policies, as an antiracist. One either allows racial inequities to persevere, as a racist, or confronts racial inequities, as an antiracist” (Kendi, 2019).

Anti-Racism is a process that includes educating oneself on the history of race and racism, and the examination of ideas, policies, and practices to ensure that they promote racial equity.

C. The Relationship of DEI to Anti-oppression, Anti-racism, and Courses of Instruction.

Fully achieving diversity, equity and inclusion and addressing disparities in higher education and in service to society also requires recognition of the pervasive role that oppression and racism play in creating inequities for learners, patients, and communities, and taking courageous and proactive steps to dismantle the elements of oppression and racism through bold and strategic actions. With respect to courses of instruction, this requires at least two actions.

1. Promoting faculty education on DEI, anti-oppression, and anti-racism to enhance awareness of, and individual and collective accountability for, the components of curricula, courses and learner experiences that contribute to inequities, exclusion, oppression and racism that suppress diversity.
2. Providing mechanisms for all faculty members involved in the teaching of UCSF learners, to develop their own acumen, as course faculty, to meaningfully improve their contributions to DEI, anti-oppression and anti-racism in the development and delivery of courses.

This initiative should not be viewed as a one-time effort to address issues that have evolved over centuries, within a much shorter span of time. Rather this should reflect the beginning of an ongoing process with continual re-examination, reflection, responsiveness, and evolution, to enhance the perspectives, experiences, and educational culture for learners and faculty and, over time, to benefit of the greater society that the University serves.

D. Current State

There are nearly 1,500 active courses at UCSF, across all 4 Schools and the Graduate Division. Typically, approximately 200 to 300 courses (new courses or courses with major changes) are reviewed annually. Some Schools, the Graduate Division, specific programs, and individual course developers have already begun the work of formally incorporating DEI, anti-oppression and anti-racism-related concepts into courses. Others may have interest or may be looking to start this work. Understanding how DEI, anti-oppression and anti-racism-related concepts are currently being considered and applied to courses across the four professional schools (Dentistry, Medicine, Nursing and Pharmacy) and the Graduate Division may serve as a prelude to developing guidance for incorporating these concepts in courses. It is hoped that prompting DEI, anti-oppression and anti-racism-related considerations will serve to stimulate course developers to advance new approaches to incorporating these concepts, where appropriate.

E. Resources and Support

COCOI recognizes that the effective advancement of DEI, anti-oppression and anti-racism also requires considering approaches that best support learners (e.g., skilled facilitation for DEI, anti-oppression, and anti-racism-focused discussions) and ensuring the provision of appropriate tools and resources for course developers and faculty (e.g., best practice examples that stimulate critical appraisal of course content and course design elements, expert consultations, etc.). The availability of advance faculty development that helps to assure competency in managing DEI within courses, where applicable; the development of effective course, faculty, and learner evaluation systems that examine DEI; and responsiveness to the feedback obtained from evaluations will also be essential elements for ongoing success.

It is equally important to recognize that, without providing the needed resources and developing the expertise of those who teach learners, to teach concepts in DEI-AO-AR, there would be an increased risk of harm to learners in this process. Ensuring that those learners who have themselves experienced oppression or marginalization in their lives are centered is also key. As such, it becomes critical to bring a trauma informed/healing centered lens to health professions education to support the thriving of all learners and this will ultimately also benefit their future patients as direct beneficiaries of healthcare care, and indirect beneficiaries of healthcare research and education.

II. Gathering Feedback

COCOI has conducted outreach and invites ongoing input on this initiative from various campus entities including the **Committee on Equal Opportunity (EQOP)**, the **Office of Diversity and Outreach (ODO)**, **Student Disability Services (SDS)**, **Student Academic Affairs**, the **UCSF Committee on Educational Policy (CEP)** and individual School educational policy and/or curriculum committees, the Deans for each School and the Graduate Division, the **Committee on Academic Freedom (CAF)**, and others, in order to engage in conversations about the state of DEI-, anti-oppression- and anti-racism-related considerations in courses, focusing on concepts, definitions, examples, precise language, and ways to encourage course developers to critically evaluate needs, and where applicable, incorporate DEI-related concepts into their courses. While this initiative originally focused broadly on DEI, the specific concepts of anti-oppression and anti-racism, which are essential considerations with respect to DEI, were featured more prominently in later drafts based on the initial feedback. Of critical importance will also be the need to seek additional feedback from learners, both prospective and retrospective, through appropriate forums.

III. Course Information Gathering Related to DEI

COCOI plans to ask course developers for all **new courses**, **reactivated courses**, and courses for which **major change** forms are being submitted, to indicate whether and, if so, how DEI, anti-

oppression and anti-racism-related concepts were **considered** or **applied** to **faculty development, course goals, course objectives, course content, and/or course design elements** (including accessibility features, pedagogy, and assessments).

Note: Application of “concepts” refers to examining faculty development, course goals, objectives, content, and design through the lenses of DEI, anti-oppression, and anti-racism and, as applicable, incorporating changes that actively advance these principles. The definition is intentionally broad so as not to indicate that there a single, “right” answer to these questions and to encourage more thoughtful reflection in the context of each specific course.

Note: Currently only course descriptions are fully public facing in the Course Catalog. Any course faculty development, objectives, content, and design elements that are submitted on the course form would be reviewed by course reviewers and may only be publicly visible to the extent that they are referenced by course faculty in syllabi or directly observed by enrolled students.

A. Course Form Update: DEI-AO-AR Related Questions

COCOI routinely reviews all **new courses**, all courses that undergo a **major revision** and all previously inactivated courses that are being **reactivated**. COCOI plans to update the Course Review Form to include DEI, anti-oppression (AO) and anti-racism (AR)-related questions. This survey is intended to stimulate thought, allow gathering of information about current efforts related to DEI-AO-AR in course development, and allow better direction of resources and referrals to support faculty in these efforts. Responses to each question would be required, however there would be no expectation of a single “right” answer. It will be important to approach all considerations and actions from a trauma informed/healing centered lens and consult the wealth of available internal and external resources to reduce the likelihood of unintended consequences from misapplied efforts. Faculty and course preparers would be encouraged to consider UCSF core values and established frameworks for DEI-AO-AR and to consult available DEI-AO-AR resources at the UCSF Campus level, and those from their respective School or Division. An example of a possible DEI-related question format is below.

The following three (3) response options would allow the course developer(s) to indicate where they are along a spectrum of considering and/or applying DEI, AO and/or AR-related concepts to a course.

Question #1

Which of the following best describes the consideration or application of concepts of Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion (DEI), Anti-oppression (AO) and/or Anti-racism (AR), for this course, with respect to faculty (assignment, development, or course preparation), course titling, goals, objectives, content, or design (e.g., accessibility, Universal Design for Learning, pedagogy, assessments, expert review of materials for equity and inclusion, etc.)?

- a. DEI-AO-AR-related concepts have not been considered for this course.
- b. DEI-AO-AR-related concepts have been considered for this course, though have not been applied to this course.
- c. DEI-AO-AR-related concepts have been considered and applied to this course.

Question #2 – This question would only appear if response B or C are selected for Question #1

What DEI-AO-AR-related concepts have been considered for this course?

Question #3 – This question would only appear if response C were selected for Question #1

What DEI-AO-AR-related concepts have been applied to this course?

Question #4

Please indicate any barriers have you encountered in considering and/or applying DEI-AO-AR-related concepts for this course, and any additional resources that would be beneficial in considering and/or applying these concepts for this course?

A general statement, like the following, would precede the questions on the course form.

The UCSF Committee on Courses of Instruction (COCOI) is encouraging all teaching faculty to consider how Diversity, Equity and Inclusion (DEI) and the concepts of anti-oppression (AO) and anti-racism (AR) may apply to their courses. COCOI also seeks to better understand how this is happening currently and to inspire actions that advance the thoughtful integration of DEI, AO, and AR, throughout courses using a trauma-informed and healing-centered lens. While the exact applicability of these concepts to specific course content may vary, reviewing and considering all aspects of a course through a DEI-AO-AR lens is of vital importance to the University's efforts to support diverse learners and their contributions to society.

In this section of the course form, please describe any ways in which DEI, AO and/or AR were considered or applied to this course in the areas of course faculty assignment, development and/or preparation, or in formulating course titling, course goals, course objectives, course content, or course design (including accessibility, pedagogy, assessment, or review of course materials for equity and inclusivity, etc.), as related to the needs of learners and/or the populations that learners are anticipated to serve (e.g., patients, society, health equity, etc.).

Any examples are provided only for illustration and to stimulate ideas for consideration. Responses should be based upon thoughtful considerations that are unique to each course and should not presume or employ a generic, "correct" response. Course approval decisions will continue to be based on holistic review. Course faculty, and course preparers are encouraged to consider UCSF core values and established frameworks for DEI-AO-AR, and to consult DEI-AO-AR resources that are available at the UCSF Campus level, or from their respective School or Division, when considering and/or applying DEI-AO-AR-related concepts in courses.

Note: *Responses to this section will not be public facing. Responses will be visible to course reviewers and may be used to guide additional resource development and to provide added consultative support for those faculty who commit to engage in this important work. Specifics questions about this form section can be directed to the COCOI.*

B. Reference Examples

As viewing course development through a DEI, anti-oppression and/or anti-racism lens may be a new experience for many course developers, to stimulate awareness, COCOI would provide several examples. Such examples could be included as informational pop-ups in the Course Form, with web-links, and/or in the Course Action Manual or as a separate reference.

Note: Examples are not intended to be all inclusive or used verbatim. They are intended to help course developers recognize actions that they may already be taking, see new possibilities, and become inspired and encouraged to take deliberate new steps to assure critical evaluation of needs, meaningful consideration for incorporating DEI, *anti-oppression and/or anti-racism*, as applicable, through faculty recruitment and preparation and the development of course-specific goals, objectives, content and design elements related to these considerations, for the benefit of learners, patients, communities, and society.

1. Examples of DEI-AO-AR-related concepts applied to *Faculty Development*.

- a. All course faculty have taken UCSF DEI Champion training that prepares faculty to teach in settings with diverse learners by developing cultural humility, recognizing concepts of power and privilege, learning basic skills to mitigate microaggressions and stereotype threats and exploring methods to improve allyship.

Note: While UCSF DEI Champion training is foundational for DEI, more advanced training would be needed to prepare faculty for effectuating trauma-informed and healing-centered discussions related to DEI. Course developers are strongly encouraged to make full use of available UCSF Campus, School and Division DEI-AO-AR resources when considering and/or applying DEI to course design.

2. Examples of DEI-AO-AR-related concepts applied to *Course Goals*

DEI, *anti-oppression and/or anti-racism*-related concepts could be applied to course goals, as applicable, by defining broad outcomes related to DEI, *anti-oppression and/or anti-racism* in the *Course Description*. Several examples follow.

- a. This course teaches learners to develop a community-engaged research project aimed at exploring and understanding factors that contribute to health disparities for groups that have been historically marginalized. Students are encouraged to select a project based their planned area of clinical specialization.

Note: Stating a goal or objective like this would require the faculty lead to ensure they are really gathering the needed expertise to responsibly embark on this kind of work.

- b. This course affords students an opportunity to develop skills in addressing unique health-related needs of diverse individuals through supervised clinical work in a community hospital that primarily supports underserved populations. All course faculty have received advanced training in concepts of Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion (DEI) including [define specify faculty training(s) or areas of expertise]. Experts in DEI [define the basis for qualifying experts] will facilitate reflective discussions related to DEI in the context of different patient encounters. Students will be assessed on their contextualization of DEI within clinical encounters.
- c. This course provides methods to assure adequate representation of subjects with diverse backgrounds in research studies. Learners will review both historical and persisting factors that have contributed to under-representation of some groups and over-representation of others as subjects in research studies, and strategies for improving representation of all communities in clinical research today.
- d. This course trains students to develop strategies for improving equity with respect to patient accessibility and disability inclusion (disability identity, culture, pride, discourse, and language) in a variety of healthcare settings.

- e. This course offers learners the opportunity to gain experience navigating complex societal issues surrounding the assurance of equity for communities with limited access to healthcare as indicated by social determinants of health.
 - f. This course focuses on identifying and addressing bias in research studies including racial, ethnic, and gender-specific biases. Learners will review several flawed historical studies related to concepts of race, ethnicity and gender and the effects of those studies on current health care systems and practices and will discuss how new protocols can avoid similar design flaws.
 - g. This course utilizes an anti-deficit framework to reframe perspectives of social and systemic barriers when discussing diversity and equity, in the context of basic science, social sciences, and health equity.
- 3. Examples of DEI-AO-AR-Related concepts applied to *Course Objectives***
- a. Using cultural humility, discuss elements of diversity, equity, and inclusion, in the context of clinical case presentations, for example, how differences related to race, ethnicity, gender, LGBTQ+ identity and disability may affect patient-clinician engagement, working diagnoses, initial workup, treatments offered, and patient education, support and referral, for common clinical conditions.
 - b. Incorporate evidence-based considerations related to diversity, equity, and inclusion into individual patient management plans that address healthcare disparities.
 - c. Apply principles of diversity, equity, and inclusion to working-up and presenting patients to a multidisciplinary care team.
 - d. Design community-engaged research protocols that address concepts of diversity, equity, and inclusion.
 - e. Identify barriers to access in healthcare settings for individuals with a disability through community engagement.
 - f. Design a community-engaged project for improving access to healthcare for patients with disabilities.
 - g. Assess the impact of DEI initiatives on population health outcomes.
 - h. Evaluate prescribing decisions that are based on factors such as race and ethnicity.
 - i. Analyze the current literature related to healthcare disparities and extract aspects that have relevance to the scope of current patient encounters.
 - j. Evaluate research subject selection practices for biases and develop approaches to assure equity in representation.
 - k. Compare medications for common medical conditions from a health equity lens.
 - l. Develop skills that foster positive perceptions of empathy in nurse-patient exchanges for patients from under-resourced communities, or communities that have been economically/socially marginalized.

- m. Discuss the bias and problematic nature of using sex-specific laboratory reference intervals, which equate biologic sex and gender and perpetuate binary perceptions of both sex and gender, and the potential impacts of this approach on the health and wellness of transgender, gender nonbinary and cisgender patients.
 - n. Examine common disparities in community hospital settings and the impact on health outcomes stratified by self-identified race, sex, gender identity and sexual orientation.
 - o. Identify common disparities that that may impact health outcomes and formulate specific care plans with an equity lens.
 - p. Review health care system factors that impact under-resourced communities, or communities that have been economically/socially marginalized.
 - q. Teach patients about their diagnosis and treatment plan using multiple modalities.
- 4. Examples of DEI-AO-AR-Related concepts applied to *Course Content***
- a. All course content has been reviewed by the DEI and AOC experts, including leaders from the UCSF Office of Diversity Outreach, Anti-Oppressive Curriculum, and Student Disability Services, to ensure equitable and non-biased representation both in prepared content (e.g., PowerPoints, readings, case studies, videos, and examples) and in assessments.
 - b. This longitudinal course includes several modules that address racism in medicine as it applies to the historical context of flawed research studies that were used as a basis for current screening and diagnostic criteria or algorithms that are stratified by race. Learners also examine newer evidence that helps to debunk older publications and discuss possible next steps to address related disparities. *
- * A summary adapted from the general work of Dana Rohde, PhD, who created several modules on Racism and Medicine used in the *Airways Breathing and Circulation* course in the School of Medicine.
- c. This course includes a module with facilitated small group discussions that focus on addressing interpersonal approaches to working with patients from diverse backgrounds and navigating sensitive topics related to provider and patient identity with potential to significantly impact a patient's health and wellness. Small group discussions are led by faculty who have undergone training in applying DEI-AO-AR to facilitated discussions. Pre-recorded standardized patient encounters are used as the basis for discussion.

5. Examples of DEI-AO-AR-Related concepts applied to *Course Design*

Universal Design for Learning and Accessibility for Students:

- a. The course design incorporates the following elements for accessibility for learners with

disabilities¹.

- 1) Closed captioning for pre-recorded audio-video content (auditory accessibility) – *Note: This is required by Federal and California State law and UCSF policy - <https://websites.ucsf.edu/accessibility-governing-policies-and-ucsf-standards>*
- 2) Real-time (live) closed captioning for lectures (auditory accessibility).
- 3) Electronic content is accessible to screen readers and other assistive technology for individuals with visual impairments based on Web Content Accessibility Guidelines (WCAG) 2.1 at level AA or higher standards (visual accessibility).
- 4) Lecture transcripts are available during class/after class for all students (auditory and cognitive accessibility).
- 5) Live lecture spaces and video conferencing services are designed to function with speech recognition software (motor accessibility).
- 6) Presentation and/or teaching in multiple sensory modalities (e.g., auditory, visual, kinesthetic) with visual including illustration and/or demonstrations when possible.²
- 7) A variety of forms of assessment modalities and tools are offered to ensure accurate evaluation of knowledge, skills, and other intended learning outcomes. This includes a mix of flexible options to test through direct observation of verbal, written and/or motor skills and simulations, as appropriate. Assessments are focused on engagement, representation, action and expression and a holistic review is used to determine whether learning objectives are met.

¹ *Accessibility* differs from *accommodation*. According to the US Department of Education, Office for Civil Rights, “Accessible means a person with a disability is afforded the opportunity to acquire the same information, engage in the same interactions, and enjoy the same services as a person without a disability in an equally effective and equally integrated manner, with substantially equivalent ease of use. The person with a disability must be able to obtain the information as fully, equally and independently as a person without a disability.” Simply put, “Accommodations are for individuals and are reactive. Accessibility is for populations and is proactive. Accessibility is the goal and accommodations are just tools to reach that goal” – UCSF Digital Accessibility Program.

Invisible (or partially invisible) disabilities: While some disabilities are visually apparent (e.g., an individual who uses a guide dog or a cane), other disabilities may be invisible all or part of the time. Many disabilities related to intermittent or chronic physical and/or mental health conditions may be “invisible” to others, while affecting visual, auditory, verbal, motor, sensory, or cognitive functioning or creating limitations with respect to concentration and focus, fatigue and possible exacerbations. It is important to support students with invisible disabilities with the same attention offered to disabilities that are observable.

<https://www.library.ucsf.edu/news/new-universal-design-for-learning-course>
<https://www.ncd.gov/publications/2022/health-equity-framework>

² A *Learning Disability* is a disorder of perception (i.e., how a student understands what he/she takes in through the sense organs) rather than acuity (i.e., whether or not the sense organ is fully functioning). Therefore, in addition to the thought given to accessibility for students who have visual or hearing impairments, equal thought needs to be given to ensuring that students with Learning Disabilities understand what they are seeing, hearing, etc.

Principles of excellence in teaching, presenting content in multiple modalities, are especially important for students with learning disabilities. Visual, auditory, and kinesthetic are the primary modalities relevant to the didactic and clinical settings with olfactory at times also being a factor in the clinical setting.

Pedagogy:

- a. This course uses trauma-informed/healing centered approaches to teach core content related to diversity equity, inclusion, anti-oppression, and anti-racism (DEI-AO-AR), through facilitation of small group sessions by internal and external resource personnel with extensive experience in the application of DEI-AO-AR principles.

Assessment:

- a. Course evaluations were aligned to include assessment of DEI-AO-AR goals and each stated DEI-AO-AR objective and vetted by the Office of Diversity and Outreach (ODO).
- b. Course evaluations are monitored carefully for outlier data with critical learner feedback that may be missed in summary data of means/averages. All written feedback is evaluated through a DEI-AO-AR lens.

C. Course Action Manual Updates

After data and examples are gathered and analyzed, COCOI plans to create a new section of the **Course Action Manual** that would address DEI-AO-AR in courses, offer additional background on the goals of this initiative, and expand explanation of the DEI section of the Course Form.

IV. Provision of Guidance

Successful consideration and application of DEI anti-oppression and antiracism-related concepts in courses requires that faculty have access to adequate resources and tools and proactively develop the skills that are required to a) recognize the need for changes and to b) implement those changes. Whereas faculty have always been expected to demonstrate excellence in their respective professional, health and science disciplines, developing skills in the concepts and framework of DEI, anti-oppression, and anti-racism, while equally critical to learner educational experiences and health care equity, has historically been underemphasized when considering faculty contributions. As such it is recognized that most faculty have very limited experience in DEI-AO-AR concepts.

Many faculty members who are engaged in teaching courses at UCSF have taken part in UCSF-sponsored Diversity Equity and Inclusion (DEI) Champion training. Many are also now familiar with principles of an Anti-Oppression Curriculum (AOC). Workshops like these provide a foundation for understanding the need to address DEI-AO-AR in the University environment. Additional resources and guidance will be necessary as faculty consider how to apply these tools to specific courses.

Chief among the understanding of this committee is that, while there is no single right way to address DEI-AO-AR in courses, there are central definitions, frameworks, and understandings that the University considers relevant and important for those doing this work to understand and that deep learning is needed/expected as faculty work to embrace DEI, anti-oppression, and anti-racism. The University has established critical pillars for this work and all faculty should be familiar with these pillars and engage in ongoing conversation with a focus on continual improvement to develop and achieve best practices. To that end, the resources that are provided herein should be considered a starting point rather than a destination.

COCOI leadership has met with leaders from the Committee on Equal Opportunity (EQOP), the Office of Diversity and Outreach (ODO), the Committee on Educational Policy (CEP) and individual School educational policy and curriculum committees, Student Academic Affairs (SAA), including, the Learning Resource Services (LRS) and Student Disability Services (SDS), and in consultation with DEI-AO-AR experts, to identify additional currently available resources, guidance and specific

examples for the incorporation of DEI-AO-AR concepts into courses. It is anticipated that guidance will also evolve as consensus around best practices for incorporating DEI-AO-AR continues to form.

V. Current Additional Resources at UCSF

A. Anti-Oppressive Curriculum (AOC) Initiative

The School of Medicine’s AOC Initiative website contains a wealth of resources for creating an equitable, inclusive, welcoming, and actively anti-oppressive clinical learning environment.

<https://meded.ucsf.edu/faculty-educators/faculty-development/aoc-initiative-resources-clinical-learning-environment>

B. Center for Faculty Educators (CFE) - Certificate in Teaching for Equity and Inclusion

The School of Medicine’s Center for Faculty Educators (CFE) offers a *Teaching for Equity and Inclusion Certificate* through its Teach for UCSF program. This Champion Training program is designed to equip faculty to bring equity and inclusion into medical education. The program is open to all who teach or will teach UCSF students, residents, fellows, and post-docs at UCSF and affiliated institutions and UCSF staff who find the program relevant to their work.

<https://meded.ucsf.edu/news/how-cfe-works-together-story-teaching-equity-and-inclusion-certificate>

Faculty leads in the *Teaching for Equity and Inclusion* workshop have developed an Equity and Inclusion Checklist to guide review of curricular materials for equity and inclusion.

<http://tiny.ucsf.edu/TEI2>

While attending the workshop provides more discussion and exchange of ideas, this resource also offers a quick and accessible way to begin the journey of considering DEI-AO-AR in courses.

C. Committee on Equal Opportunity (EQOP) - <https://senate.ucsf.edu>

The Committee on Equal Opportunity EQOP reports on and makes recommendations regarding issues relating to gender equity and underrepresented minority (URM) groups at UCSF. EQOP also advises the Academic Senate’s Committee on Academic Personnel of any language pertaining to diversity, inclusion or equal opportunity that should be added to, revised in, or deleted from the Faculty Handbook for Advancement and Promotion at UCSF.

D. Educational Technology Services (ETS) - <https://edtech.ucsf.edu>

Educational Technology Services (ETS) offers innovative technology, and a full suite of media services for education including video conferencing, class capture, video production, and more.

Class Capture: <https://edtech.ucsf.edu/class-capture>

E. Graduate Faculty Development Program - <https://mentoring.ucsf.edu>

The Graduate Faculty Development program has published a mentoring resource guide and <https://mentoring.ucsf.edu/faculty-racism-dialogue> a wealth of additional resources for engaging

in dialog related to race and antiracism (<https://mentoring.ucsf.edu/silence-harmful>).

The Graduate Division DEI Primer contains a glossary of terms and frameworks that are used in courses and programs. This glossary helps to operationalize DEI practices and ensures that participants are using a shared language for defining and thinking about DEI.

https://mentoring.ucsf.edu/sites/g/files/tkssra1151/f/wysiwyg/Graduate%20Division%20DEI%20Primer_0.pdf

F. Information Technology (IT) - <https://it.ucsf.edu>

UCSF IT's Digital Accessibility Program offers additional resources to improve accessibility in the digital learning environment.

<https://it.ucsf.edu/service/digital-accessibility-program>

G. Learning Resource Services (LRS) - <https://learn.ucsf.edu>

UCSF Learning Resource Services “offers support to help UCSF students in all schools and the Graduate Division improve their academic and clinical success through various methods.

H. Office of Diversity and Outreach (ODO) - <https://diversity.ucsf.edu>

The UCSF Office of Diversity and Outreach “is committed to building a broadly diverse community, nurturing a culture that is welcoming and supportive, and engaging diverse ideas for the provision of culturally competent education, discovery, and patient care.” and has launched the UCSF Anti-Racism Initiative.

<https://diversity.ucsf.edu/initiatives/anti-racism-initiative>

I. Student Disability Services (SDS) - <https://sds.ucsf.edu>

SDS gives “individualized consideration of each student’s abilities, the functional impact of their disability, and program standards in order to devise creative and innovative accommodation solutions to ensure equitable access to students with disabilities.” Additional disability resources for accessibility and accommodation can be found at <https://disability.ucsf.edu>.

<https://disability.ucsf.edu/campus-accessibility>

J. UCSF Library - <https://www.library.ucsf.edu>

The UCSF Library offers a variety of technical and multimedia support resources, such as, Otter.ai (a cloud-based, live transcription and captioning service that integrates with Zoom) for real-time (live) closed captioning of lectures (auditory accessibility). Lecture transcripts (auditory and cognitive accessibility) are automatically created when Otter.ai is enabled.

Universal-design-for-learning-course: <https://www.library.ucsf.edu/news/new-universal-design-for-learning-course>

Instructional Design: <https://www.library.ucsf.edu/ask-an-expert/faculty/instructional-design>

Class Capture: <https://ucsflibrary.zendesk.com/hc/en-us/articles/360060707994-Otter-Overview>

Multi-media Support: <https://www.library.ucsf.edu/ask-an-expert/multimedia>
Includes tools such as Otter.ai for transcriptions/captioning

Remote Teaching and Learning Resources: <https://www.library.ucsf.edu/ask-an-expert/learning-tech-group/teaching-and-learning-continuity>

Collaborative Learning Environment (CLE) Support: <https://www.library.ucsf.edu/ask-an-expert/faculty/cle>

VI. Additional Challenges and Needs

COCOI identified the following areas for which more resource support may be needed and is putting out a call-to-action to those within the UCSF Community who have interest to participate.

- A. Dismantling Racism Works (dRworks) describes six stages of racial equity, i.e., familiar dysfunction, explicit commitment to racial equity, unfamiliar dysfunction (culture shift/not knowing/frustration), relational trust, explicit equity goals clarified, and equity practice. <https://www.dismantlingracism.org/analysis-tools.html> Progress through these stages is a longitudinal objective requiring long-term commitment and continual work.
- B. On the individual level it is anticipated that, while many faculty have now been exposed to concepts in DEI, anti-oppression and anti-racism and may have undergone DEI Champion training, the practice of implementing the elements these concepts in courses is new for many and may engender feelings of apprehension, concern, and even resistance to change. Dr. Camara Jones emphasizes four charges to 1) be courageous, 2) be curious, 3) be collective, 4) build community.
- C. Currently, the progress towards development of DEI, anti-oppression and anti-racism-related resources may vary across each school and graduate division. Several initiatives aimed at addressing these themes have been presented. Ensuring unifying approach to general principles will require collaboration with all stakeholders.
- D. This effort may also be helped by the development of additional resources and examples of DEI-related concepts that are specific to each UCSF School and the Graduate Division, including expansion of examples that would apply to pre-clinical courses within the professional Schools. While it is recognized that DEI, anti-oppression, and anti-racism related concepts are often not the intended primary focus of content for most basic science and preclinical courses, very often content presented contains implicit, often unintended, hidden messages about race, ethnicity, gender, sexuality, disability, and other aspects of identity that undermine anti-racism and anti-oppression efforts and may instead sustain and support biased, oppressive beliefs, policies, and practices. These subtle yet impactful influences form a hidden curriculum within course goals, course objectives, course content and course design. Only course developers and teaching faculty supported by a) feedback (from reviewers and learners), b) the availability of appropriate resources and c) direct engagement in continual faculty development related to DEI-AO-AR, can ultimately address these influences in a manner that meaningfully contributes to a diverse, equitable, inclusive, anti-oppressive and anti-racist learning environment.
- E. COCOI initially considered seeking to identify a community of champions with expertise in DEI at the campus level, and within each School and the Graduate Division, who could serve as consultants for course faculty and preparers. One concern that arose is that “many people may want to do DEI work but may not do it right,” which can lead unintended consequences and worse outcomes. While it is hoped that more DEI leaders will emerge from this process, at least initially, faculty in need of guidance would be directed to DEI-AO-AR leaders at the Campus level and within their respective School or Division. Additional proposed considerations have been to

leverage internal resources from groups with a focus in education. It would also be key to look outside of UCSF for learning and expertise and inviting expert consultants from outside of the health professions to partner with as the University engages in this important work.

- F. This initial focus for this initiative is on the application of DEI, anti-oppression and anti-racism-related concepts course goals, objectives, content, and design. It follows that course developers should consider ways to tie course, faculty, and learner assessments to the stated goals, objectives, content, and design elements in a way that evaluation of the expected outcome(s) of incorporating DEI, anti-oppression, and anti-racism-related concepts. Currently many evaluations are generic, and it may be difficult to obtain granular data on each element from each learner. At the same time is important to appreciate that individual or outlier data is meaningful in considering these concepts. This is because current approaches of simply reporting means/averages in evaluation data can obscure important critical learner feedback.
- G. COCOI recognizes that sustaining or expanding this initiative would require considerable effort and may necessitate the participation of internal experts at the Campus level and from each School and the Graduate Division. Given the potential time commitment and effort, in accordance with the University's stated priorities, this work would need to be adequately compensated and supported to succeed.
- H. COCOI also seeks to directly engage learners from each School and the Graduate Division in the initial and ongoing review and development of this initiative and with the assessments of needs that will inform which DEI-AO-AR-related resources are best to support course developers.

VII. Next Steps

- A. COCOI will work with the Senate programmer to update the Course Review System to include the described DEI, anti-oppression, and anti-racism-related questions in the course form for all new courses and all courses undergoing major revisions or reactivation.
- B. Due to the volume of active courses (currently >1,400) and the time required for additional reviews, older courses would need to be cycled for review in phases.
- C. Data gathered from the Course Review System will provide an opportunity for further refinements in successive committee years or for sharing amalgamated data with EQOP, ODO, SAA or other committees and offices with a mutual interest in furthering the state DEI in courses. Analysis of responses obtained over the initial review period to determine the percentage of courses for which DEI-related concepts have been incorporated (or considered) and how DEI-related concepts are being applied may provide a foundation for additional work and allow selection and highlighting of best practice examples and new resources for further dissemination.
- D. Longitudinal considerations including advocacy for increased allocation of UCSF resources to the development and enhancement of DEI-AO-AR centers at the Campus level and within each School and the Graduate Division, will be important to achieve sustainability of this effort.
- E. COCOI will explore working with each School and the Graduate Division to identify student forums for feedback and ongoing development and selection of resources.

VIII. Acknowledgements

COCOI would like to acknowledge the following groups and specific individuals who have provided direct input for this initiative.

UCSF Academic Senate Executive Council (EXC)

- Steven Cheung, MD, Chair 2021-2023

UCSF Committee on Academic Freedom (CAF)

- Melike Pekmezci, MD, Committee on Academic Freedom, Chair 2021-22

UCSF Committee on Educational Policy (CEP)

- Mary Lynch, DNP, MPH, PNP, Chair, 2021-2022

UCSF Committee on Educational Technology (CET)

- Tracy Fulton, PhD, Committee on Educational Technology, Chair

UCSF Committee on Equal Opportunity (EQOP)

- Andreea Seritan, MD, Committee on Equal Opportunity, Chair 2021-22

UCSF Education Deans Council

- Nicquet Blake, Dean of Graduate Division & Vice-Provost of Student Academic Affairs
- Jennifer Perkins, School of Dentistry Executive Director of Clinical Education
- Catherine Lucey, School of Medicine Associate Dean of Education
- Mary Lynch, School of Nursing Associate Dean of Education
- Sharon Youmans, School of Pharmacy Associate Dean of Education
- Amber Fitzsimmons, Physical Therapy Chair
- Chris Shaffer, University Librarian & Assistant Vice Chancellor, Academic Information Management

UCSF Graduate Council

- Dyche Mullins, PhD, Chair

UCSF Graduate Division

- Nicquet Blake, PhD, Vice Provost, Student Academic Affairs, Dean, Graduate Division
- Liz Silva, PhD, Associate Dean, Graduate Division
- Isaac JT Strong, PhD, Director, Graduate Faculty Development
- D'Anne Duncan, PhD, Assistant Dean for Diversity and Learner Success

UCSF Office of Diversity and Outreach

- Renée Navarro, PharmD, MD, Vice Chancellor of Diversity and Outreach
- Tiffani Chan, MA, Manager, Anti-Racism Initiative
- Wendy Tobias, CRC, LPCC, Chief Accessibility and Inclusion Officer

UCSF Presidential Chair, 2022-2022

- Camara Phyllis Jones, MD, MPH, PhD

UCSF School of Dentistry Educational Policy Committee (EPC)

- Elizabeth Joyce, PhD, Chair, 2021-2022

UCSF School of Medicine Anti-Oppressive Curriculum (AOC) Initiative

- Denise Connor, MD, Director, Anti-Oppression Curriculum Initiative

UCSF School of Medicine Center for Faculty Educators (CFE)

- Kate Lupton, MD, Sponsor, Teach for UCSF Certificate in Teaching for Equity and Inclusion
- Patricia O'Sullivan, EdD., Director, Research and Development in Medical Education

UCSF School of Medicine Committee on Curriculum and Educational Policy (CCEP)

- Shelley Adler, PhD, Chair, 2021-2022

UCSF School of Nursing Associate Dean, Diversity, Inclusion and Outreach

- Mica Estrada, PhD

UCSF School of Nursing Education Policy Coordinating Council (EPCC)

- Mary Lynch, DNP, MPH, PNP, Chair 2021-2022

UCSF School of Pharmacy Curriculum & Educational Policy Committee (CEPC)

- Michael Grabe, Chair 2021-2022

UCSF Student Academic Affairs

- Nicquet Blake, PhD, Vice Provost, Student Academic Affairs, Dean, Graduate Division
- Matt Epperson, Assistant Vice Chancellor, Educational Technology Services
- Peggy Ryan, Learning Specialist, Learning Resource Services
- Susan Whitlow, Learning Specialist, Learning Resource Services
- Timothy Montgomery, Co-Director, Student Disability Services
- Clayton Littrell, Co-Director, Student Disability Services

Zane Amenhotep, MD, Chair, Committee on Courses of Instruction 2021-2022

Annette Carley, RN, DNP, NP, Chair, Committee on Courses of Instruction 2022-2023

Inez Bailey, MS, Vice Chair, Committee on Courses of Instruction 2022-2023